

Inclusive pedagogy in the humanities: a workbook.

**Patrick Collier
David Concepcion
Allyson DeMaagd
Sreyoshi Sarkar**

Contents

Foreword	1
1 Becoming an Inclusive Teacher	
2 Creating inclusive learning environments	10
Inclusive course climate and tone	
Inclusive learning polices	
3 Designing Inclusive Courses	18
Inclusive learning goals	
Inclusive course content	
Inclusive learning activities	
4 Assessing students equitably	23
Inclusive assessment	
Equitable grading	
Appendices	26

Foreword

Purpose and design

This workbook is designed for hands-on use by college teachers in humanities subjects who wish to make their pedagogy more inclusive in all ways. It thus focuses not only on the content students encounter (whether they include diverse voices in the culture or discipline under study) but on routine classroom practices, class climate, assessment, and the lenses through which the teacher views and approaches everything that takes place in the educational setting.

The workbook is designed as a series of steps any teacher can take when preparing for a semester, beginning with analysis of the teacher's own attitudes and dispositions; proceeding through adoption of inclusive pedagogical practices across all classes, and ultimately focusing on details of course design. In course design the workbook assumes a backwards-design model, beginning with objectives and learning outcomes and proceeding through class assignments, activities, and assessments.

Axes of Diversity

While "inclusiveness" frequently invokes racial equity, effective inclusive pedagogy is intersectional, taking care to consider multiple axes of diversity that might influence successful learning in any student, cohort, or class setting. These include:

- Educational Diversity: level/type of entry qualifications; skills; abilities; knowledge; educational experience; life and work experience; learning approaches.
- Dispositional diversity: Identity; self-esteem; confidence; motivation; aspirations; expectations; preferences; attitudes; assumptions; beliefs; emotional intelligence; maturity; learning styles; perspectives; interests; self-awareness; gender; sexuality.
- Circumstantial diversity: Age, disability; paid/voluntary employment; caring responsibilities; geographical location; access to IT and transport services; flexibility; time available; entitlements; financial background and means; marital status.
- Cultural diversity: Language; values; cultural capital; religion and belief; country of origin/residence; ethnicity/race; social background.¹

Success-Compatibility

The complexity of these axes of diversity, and the many overlapping considerations that go into creating an inclusive class, can prove intimidating to the teacher seeking to adapt his/her/their pedagogy. We find, though, that a focus on the success compatibility of course designs and practices simplifies and focuses teacher effort on inclusiveness. In short, success

¹ Liz Thomas and Helen May, *Inclusive learning and teaching in higher education.* York: Higher Education Academy (2010). <https://www.heacademy.ac.uk/knowledge-hub/inclusive-learning-and-teaching-higher-education>

compatibility means designing courses and assignments and following practices that ensure the largest possible number of students can learn successfully.

The success compatibility model thus emphasizes the arena in which teachers have the most agency: in their designs and practices, as well as their ways of thinking about diversity and pedagogy. Where “preparedness” – both academic and cultural – is an aspect of students, success “compatibility” tracks the extent to which a course provides each student an equal chance to succeed. A course is highly success compatible when a strong majority of students face few unnecessary barriers to achieving the learning objectives and most experience significant individual support. A course is less success compatible to the degree that some students face more barriers or experience less support than other students.

Instructors seeking to increase the success compatibility of their courses focus on both academic and cultural dimensions of success compatibility. In higher education it is often the cultural dimension where the most innovation is needed.

An example of a potential cultural difference where faculty choices impact success compatibility may be helpful here. Most students with care-giving responsibilities or forty hours of employment a week are very likely to not have a great deal of flexibility in their schedules. (Notice: this has nothing to do with academic aptitude nor a willingness to work hard. It has to do with family composition and income needs.) As a result, adding (large) assignments which are due soon after they are assigned, especially if successful completion of the assignment requires a synchronous meeting outside of class time, creates differential access to success. Some students will have a much easier time meeting this new expectation than others, and the course becomes less success compatible than it could be. The point is not that faculty should never add new assignments. Rather, the point is that instructors should carefully consider the potentially differential impact their actions may have on students’ ability to succeed. More often than not, such a differential impact is unjustified.

How to Use this Workbook

The four sections of this workbook are sequenced to build upon one another, beginning with philosophical foundations and continuously getting more practical, specific, and detail-oriented, as they proceed through creating an inclusive class space and environment, devising and articulating inclusive learning goals and activities, and assessing students equitably.

Individual teachers will come to this workbook with differing levels of experience in thinking about and practicing inclusive pedagogy. Ball State and other universities have been increasingly offering resources, toolkits, workshops, and other professional development opportunities focused on diversity and inclusion. The fact that you are accessing this workbook suggests interest and, most likely, experience with inclusive pedagogy.

Thus many users of this workbook may already have done extensive work, for instance, articulating an inclusive teaching philosophy or identifying implicit biases. Others might have studied assessment extensively but not done significant work integrating diverse voices into their syllabi. For this reason we urge you to use this workbook in whatever ways meet your specific needs now, skipping among and within its major sections. Users who follow the workbook from start to finish will find substantial overlap and some repetition between sections. This is both inevitable, as pedagogical choices are not fully separable (one creates tone and climate in the course of articulating learning outcomes, for example, and not merely in

stating policies) and purposeful, as the workbook is meant to be useful to teachers who want to focus on one or several but not all of the sections.

Each section leads the user through a set of self-evaluation questions on its topic. Several reference further reading, provided either as links or as appendices to this document. And each section concludes by asking the user to list specific adjustments he/she/they will make having undergone the analysis and/or done the reading.

1. Becoming an Inclusive Teacher

At the highest level, being an inclusive teacher is a matter of virtues that are translated into actions whenever we design educational experiences or interact with students. A virtue is a predisposition to act in certain ways across a wide range of circumstances. When we say a person has the virtue “kindness,” what we mean is that they are kind to nearly everyone in a great majority of situations. In other words, supposed character traits that aren’t realized in action are not virtues as they are understood here.

The steps below identify teacher virtues that place the teacher in position to ensure success for the highest possible percentage of students. For each teacher virtue, a set of questions follows to prompt reflection and action to strengthen that virtue. Space is provided at the bottom of each for you to identify action items to develop your inclusive teacher virtues.

Inclusive Teacher Virtues

1. An inclusive teacher is learner-centered

A learner-centered teacher habitually asks themselves: What does each student in my course need me to (1) ask them to do, (2) do with them, and/or (3) do for them, so that they will learn as much as possible?

What do I need to discover about my students to be able to act learner-centered?

- o How does their understanding of their identity influence how and what they hear?
- o Do they know how to take the type of notes that are most beneficial to them in this course?
- o Do they know how to read/consume media in the way most beneficial to them in this course?
- o Which form of “How-To” instruction do they need prior to undertaking a large assignment? How much repetitive practice do they need prior to working on the assignment on their own?
- o Which form of feedback on their work is most productive for them?

Using your answers to the above questions, list 2-3 changes you can make to become more learner-centered

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

2. An inclusive teacher is empowered

An empowered teacher has an optimistic but realistic sense of the role he/she/they can play in student learning. As Terry Doyle (*Learner-Centered Teaching*, Stylus, 2011) says, “The one who does the work, does the learning.” Learning is a change inside students that they bring about by performing activities. Teaching is the practice of designing activities and experiences, and giving feedback at the right time, to help students learn.

Inclusive teachers approach their activity design and feedback efforts with a commitment to maximizing the learning of each student. Such a teacher changes “My students can’t X” or “I can’t get my students to X” to “I haven’t yet been able to help these students X yet,” and then to “I’m going to figure out new ways to help my students X.” On the one hand, this is about having the right beliefs about students’ abilities. But is it more about having the right beliefs about one’s capacity as a teacher.

- o Do I avoid a “deficit mindset” that becomes bogged down or frustrated with what students cannot do? Am I committed to building a growth mindset (Carol Dweck, *Mindset*, 2017) in myself and my students?
- o Have I studied the teaching and learning literature on how best to enable students to achieve the major learning objectives in my discipline?
- o Have I studied the teaching and learning literature on how best to teach the particular students in my actual classes?
- o Am I willing to look foolish? Will I try something that should work even if I recognize that it might not?

Using your answers to the above questions, list 2-3 ways you can become a more empowered teacher

- 1.
- 2.

3.

3. An inclusive teacher is committed to reducing his/her/their implicit biases

We all have automatic associations, an unconscious pairing of values and types of things. They become problematic when they taint our behavior such that we unwittingly give certain benefits and/or harms to only some (types) of people. The task is threefold. (1) Make as many of one's currently implicit biases explicit, (2) put procedures in place that undermine one's ability to act on them while one works on eliminating the bias, and (3) work on eliminating the bias.

(1) Making implicit bias explicit

o Have I taken implicit bias tests?

<https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/takeatest.html>,

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_cognitive_biases

o Who can I safely talk with to discover more about my biases?

o How can I observe myself to find implicit biases?

In particular, be on the look out for what we may call "good person" bias, a tendency to engage in shallow or incomplete critical reflection regarding one's potential to harm others because one believes they are a good person. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_cognitive_biases

(2) Procedures

o Is anonymous grading possible in my course? See John M. Malouff and Einar B. Thorsteinsson, "Bias in Grading: a meta-analysis of experimental research findings." Australian Journal of Educational

<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0004944116664618>

o Which turns of a phrase should I not allow myself to use? Which should I weave into my common usage?

o Which interaction patterns (e.g., listening first) should I adopt? Excise?

o Which data should I collect regarding the outcomes of my teaching to inform the creation of other un-biasing activities?

(3) Eliminating Bias

Insofar as formerly implicit biases are now explicit, one can begin to change them by acting to avoid and undermine them. We can each hold ourselves to high standards even as we are forgiving our on-going errors. Manifesting a commitment to behavioral change daily is the effort to be taken. Some change

happens quickly, but other change takes more time. Be relentless but patient. Involve those close to you to help.

Considering the three steps described above, list 2-3 concrete steps you can take to reduce the impact your negative implicit biases have on student learning

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

4. An inclusive teacher is vulnerable.

Because each teacher unavoidably has their own, singular cultural history, it is highly likely that they have behavioral preferences and habits that are not the most conducive to the learning of every student. As such, an inclusive teacher seeks information about how they are perceived so as to make changes that increase the number of students who are motivated by the teacher.

Authenticity is motivating. Don't burden students with troubles from your private life, but be a person with them. Show them your best professional self in full. When providing examples, use something real from your life as often as appropriate. Share how you feel, your emotions, about issues, not only your scholarly, intellectual reaction.

Develop an explicit understanding of the kind of relationship with students that is most conducive to their learning. Construct a simile. I am to my students as ____ is to _____. (Avoid common ones, such as coach is the athlete, guide is to tourist, etc.) Rather, develop an uncommon, even unique, simile to shape your understanding of what the best, full version of your professional self is. Refer to it often as you think about your interactions with students. Is the role you have give yourself open to criticism from students?

Actively demonstrate that the course is not about you, the teacher. Consider how to communicate a lack self-importance. Communicate (through multiple channels) that student learning, not the teacher's ego, is the focus of the course.

How open am I to criticism from students?

How willing am I to change my plans because students have asked me to?

If students don't ever ask me to make changes, why is that? Do I need to solicit student input more actively? Do I need to be more vulnerable so students feel comfortable providing feedback spontaneously?

How willing am I to change my plans because student performance suggests insufficient learning has taken place?

In general, am I too wedded to my initial plans? Am I willing to admit that a plan wasn't particularly good by changing it in real time? Do I have processes in place to receive feedback in multiple ways throughout a semester and make adjustments?

See, Jeanine Weekes Schroer, "Fighting Imperviousness with Vulnerability: Teaching in a Climate of Conservatism" *Teaching Philosophy*, 30:2, June 2007.

<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/084a/646c77f544d040c2c34f2cd0414ade3055fd.pdf>

Using your answers to the above questions, list 2-3 ways you can become a more vulnerable teacher

1.

2.

3.

5. In a class setting, an inclusive teacher is one among many with cognitive authority

One has cognitive authority when one is taken by others and oneself as having ideas, beliefs, and values that are worth sharing and hearing. It is a kind of standing in a community or classroom. Those taken to have cognitive authority are taken by the community to be valued knowledge constructors.

Virtuous teachers believe that all members of the classroom have cognitive authority. They work with students who do not yet believe they have cognitive authority to help them recognize that they have it, and grow it. Disciplinary expertise and knowledge are not a requirement for cognitive authority. Believing (even rightly) that all students have cognitive authority is insufficient for living this virtue. One's belief must be shown through one's behavior. Virtuous teachers share conversational space so that voices other than their own are often centered.

This virtue may appear to be in tension with ordinary responsibilities of teachers, such as delivering accurate content and ensuring that students meet knowledge acquisition standards. It isn't. It can be appropriate that the most expert person in a room speak more than, and organize the activities of, people with less expertise. This virtue is about

the value accorded to non-teachers. How this value is translated into how common time in the classroom is used varies.

Are the disciplinary novices in my course co-equals as cognitive authorities?
 What do I do to show that I believe in equality of cognitive authority in my course?
 When and why do I decenter myself? When should I?

Using your answers to the above questions, list 2-3 ways you can better share cognitive authority

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

6. An inclusive teacher is curious, hospitable, and generous with praise

A curious teacher gives uptake to the unfamiliar. To give uptake involves asking questions and listening for understanding, as opposed to listening to figure out how respond. Giving uptake, a way of communicating a belief in shared cognitive authority, and agreeing are two different things. One may ultimately disagree, but unless one understands what a person said, and why they said it, one does not disagree in a way that is maximally productive for learning.

A hospitable teacher graciously attends to the needs of their guests. Teachers are keepers of disciplinary culture, and there is no reason students should be aware of them. Whether students are aware of, and guided through, disciplinary folkways impacts their success. Imagine you are throwing a party where a majority of the guests are, but some sizable number are not, familiar with the folkways of this party. How might you prepare, or be at the side of, a guest who does not know the folkways of your party? Many students do not know how to perform the tasks we set them to. For most teachers, more explicit "How To" instruction is needed. While this "How To" instruction benefits most students, it has a differentially positive impact on first generation college students (and some others) who are not familiar with the relevant folkways.

Experts may forget the difficulty associated with initial learning in their area of expertise. A predictable result is that praise is not given for achievements that might be conceived of as ordinary from the point of view of the expert. But from the point of view of the learning, the achievements may be hard won and significant. Particularly in courses with controversial topics, values affirmation - explicitly praising the worth of people who may

experience stereotype threat in a classroom (e.g. showing that one values women's expertise in math classes in contrast to a widely held cultural belief that many women may have internalized that women are not good at math) - appears to reduce stereotype threat and improve learning, although sometimes these gains are transitory (i.e. only effective in one course). Zezhen Wu, Thees F. Spreckelsen, and Geoffrey L. Cohen, "A meta-analysis of the effect of values affirmation on academic achievement (*Journal of Social Issues* (Jan. 2021): doi.org/10.1111/josi.12415).

When students talk, do I listen for understanding? Do I affirm the quality of the student's contribution and ask a follow-up questions seeking to learn more from the student before responding?

Do I know what the academic folkways that I embody and disseminate in my courses are? Do I explicitly show (not merely explain) them to students? Do I give "How To" instruction for all of the significant assignments in my course? Do I ask students to practice the activity and give them feedback on their attempts before assigning work that is a significant portion of the term grade?

Am I effusive with praise? Am I preparing students with values affirmation?

Using your answers to the above questions, list 2-3 ways you can better express curiosity, hospitality, and praise to students

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

7. An inclusive teacher is flexible

To treat all students fairly, one must treat like cases alike. Individual policy exceptions increase the likelihood that implicit bias will taint decisions. But strict adherence to (strict) policies will likely differentially negatively impact the most vulnerable of one's students. For example, if attendance is allowed to impact student grades, then students with illnesses, family care duties, high hours of working for wages, etc. are most likely to earn lower grades in a course. Insofar as attendance is a means to learning, and grades should reflect learning, when students who are able to learn just as well as others even though they have more absences, term grades reflect ability to show up at a specific time and place, not amount of learning. Perhaps some sort of attendance policy is appropriate, but excused absence should include almost anything other than "I just chose to not come." If not, grades are reflecting comportment and not learning, and the folks most likely to not demonstrate the desired comportment are likely less privileged than those who do.

Have I evaluated the flexibility of all of my course policies, including attendance and the acceptance of late work? Am I appropriately flexible in all cases so as to minimize the impact that non-learning related factors have on student learning?

Using your answers to the above questions, list 2-3 increases in flexibility that should increase the number of students who have a pathway to success and excellence in your course:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

2. Creating Inclusive Learning Environments

An inclusive learning environment is a learning space (physical classroom or online) in which students feel safe and respected, and see themselves as important members of the class community, with easy access to all they require to fully participate in learning.

Self-workshop:

The sections below are designed to help you think through your current syllabi, class environments, and activities to check for inclusive measures in your current pedagogy, think about what needs more work, and offer a few examples and resources that might be useful as you revise existing activities and teaching plans.

Step 1: Self-analysis

Analysis 1:

Review your understanding of “inclusive learning” and take stock of personal attitudes and practices that embody biases.

- How do I define “inclusive learning environment”? Why is it important for my students’ success?
- What value do I see in empowering student learning and voices at intersections of disability, gender, race, class, religion, age, nationality, sexuality, and other socio-cultural-cognitive categories of lived experience?

- How does my current pedagogy (syllabus, reading/viewing materials, class activities, assignments, and assessments) acknowledge and attend to the experiences of students from different backgrounds?
If you answer “No” or “not completely” to this question, see Sections 3 and 4 of this workbook.
- Am I aware of my own conscious or unconscious biases about people from other races and cultures? How do I know this?
If you answer “No” or “not completely” to this question, see Section 1 of this workbook.
- Do biases, conscious or unconscious, underlie my reading materials, whom I call upon to answer questions or pass over in class, my grading practices, and how I approach/monitor discussions about race, nationality, color, etc.? How do I know?
- Do I have different expectations of students of color than I do of white students, of male vs. female students, of students from the LGBTQ+ community, of American students vs. those from other countries/cultures? How do I know this?
- Am I aware of what constitutes microaggressions in the classroom?
- How can I prepare to address microaggressions or manage conflicts that arise in my classroom?
- What kind of resources/help might I need to address such situations? What kind of resources are available?
- Who might I ask about this?

See Appendix for reading materials to help you think through these points:

- “Diversity and Inclusiveness in the Classroom.” University of Arizona. Jesús Treviño.
- Classroom Accountability Toolkit. BSU. 2021.

Action Items: Pedagogical adjustments and/or resources to access.

Having considered the questions above (and read the UArizona’s guide), list 2-3 adjustments to your pedagogy, syllabus, week 1 conversations, or other course design elements that you will add, delete, or revise as a result of this exercise.

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Step 2: Establishing inclusive course climate and tone

Analysis 1: Tone-setting activities

Review your syllabus, classroom policy statements, and/or first day lectures/discussions/plans to see how you are establishing climate, tone, and expectations for learning and interactions in the class.

- Do I make clear at the start of the semester that my class is intended to be an inclusive space? How?
- Have I made time and space to discuss and set some common agreements for discussion and engagement that makes the classroom inclusive? How?
- Do I make clear in my syllabus and in my class introductions and activities that I treat students as individuals, encouraging them to share their own lives and interests? How?
- Do I make clear that I value alternative perspectives, debate ideas, and would like to create an environment which is open to representation of different viewpoints? How?
- Have I made time and space in week 1 of classes to clearly explain my expectations of students in the classroom and ask students for their input on expectations of me? How and where?

See Appendix for examples of inclusive documents:

- List of expectations for students and professor (excerpt from syllabus provided by Dave Largent, Associate Lecturer of Computer Science, BSU)
- Letter to students at the start of class underscoring the inclusive, decentralized classroom. (Excerpt from syllabus provided by Dr. Sreyoshi Sarkar, Assistant Professor of English, BSU)

Action Items: Measures to create inclusive tone, climate, and norms of engagement

Having considered the questions above (and checked out the examples), list 2-3 adjustments to your syllabus, week 1 conversations, or other course design elements that you will add, delete, or revise as a result of this exercise.

1.

2.

3.

Analysis 2: Organization of learning spaces

Review physical classroom organization

- Is my classroom organized in a way that encourages student interactions with the course materials, with me, and with each other? How?

- Is the class setting/furniture arrangement one that encourages conversations, small group work, or more top-down lecture-style? How?
- What arrangement of furniture/space would best meet the learning objectives of the classroom while empowering student participation all around? How?
- How can I shift things around to decentralize learning for the course?
- Can I seek classroom spaces that enable interactive and activity-based learning? (TC 112, TC 114, RB 109 etc.)

Review online classroom organization

- Do my online learning materials - text, audio, video etc. - meet the Universal Design for Learning Guidelines? Which guidelines do they meet? What more do I need to do to make these materials accessible to all my students across psychological, cognitive, physical, and cultural differences?
- What kind of resources and support persons might I have access to who might help me understand and integrate these UDLs in my Canvas courses?
- When requiring students to use Zoom, Webex or other virtual in-person platforms, do I require them to turn on their video feed throughout? How does this meet my learning objectives or empower meaningful student learning and success in this course?
- If the video feed is indeed essential for class participation and effective learning in my online classroom, have I explained this to my students? Have we had a conversation about what students feel about this or alternative ways to achieve participation goals if they feel stressed/hampered by this requirement? How did it go and what did I learn from it?

See Appendix for readings on inclusive classroom organization:

- “Toward Inclusive Learning Spaces: Physiological, Cognitive, and Cultural Inclusion and the Learning Space Rating System.” Richard Holeton. *Educause Review*. 28 February 2020.
- Universal Design for Learning Guidelines.
- “Teaching into the Abyss: Addressing Students’ Camera Usage (or Lack Thereof!) in Zoom.” Virginia Pitts. October 2020. Office of Teaching and Learning, University of Denver.

Action Items: Adaptations of learning spaces

Having considered the questions above (and checked out the additional readings on classroom organization), list 2-3 adjustments to your classroom organization/space you will consider/make as a result of this exercise.

1.

2.

3.

Step 3: Inclusive Learning Policies

Inclusive Learning Policies spell out course rules and procedures that will be followed in the classroom to ensure all learning objectives are achieved while simultaneously ensuring they accommodate students' different needs and challenges. They ensure that every student in the classroom has equally strong opportunities for success in the course despite having different levels of college-readiness, socio-economic-cultural backgrounds and experiences, and other background factors.

Analysis 1:

Review my current learning policies for this course

- Have I explicitly stated the learning objectives for this course in my syllabus, how they contribute to student's skill sets and lives, and ensured that the policies match these goals? Where?
- Do I make it a point to explain and discuss this with students at the beginning of the semester and then from time to time as we move forward in the course? How do I do this?
- Do I encourage my students to be part of these conversations? Do I seek student feedback about them from time to time and make any changes to make them cater better to my students' different learning needs, abilities, and levels? How?
- Do I have a prototypical student in mind when creating these policies? What do I expect from them?
- If students do not match up to this model student criteria and struggle with my class policies, how do I react to/feel about them?
- Does this affect my attitude towards them in class, outside of class, or while grading - how?
- Do I give up on students who are struggling with the course or do I think there are ways to work with them to ensure their participation and success in my class? How?

See Appendix for examples of inclusive learning policies:

- Share assignments and due dates with students well in advance of when they're due. (excerpt from syllabus provided by Dr. Keshia Coker, Assistant Professor of Marketing, BSU)
- Transparent and structured Assignment Descriptions; Feedback loops; and Statement on Plagiarism (excerpts from syllabus provided by Dr. Emily Rutter, Associate Professor of English, BSU)

Your Revisions

Having considered the questions above (and checked out examples of learning policies), list 2-3 adjustments to your syllabus and policies you will consider/make as a result of this exercise.

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Analysis 2

Review Attendance and Late policy for this course

- Is my attendance policy punitive OR formative? Which of the two will really support student success and learning in my course?
- Is my attendance and late policy clearly outlined in the syllabus along with the purpose it serves for this course? Where?
- Do I have a conversation with students at the beginning of the semester, in between, or at the end to discuss these policies and hear their responses to it? How do I do this?
- Am I flexible within reason for life emergencies, physical and mental health issues, eldercare, childcare, and other care commitments, and other unavoidable circumstances that might affect my students' attendance and punctuality? How do I work this out in my policies?
- Do I take into account religious holidays and make a list of them in the syllabus so both the students and I are on the same page about those?

Your Revisions

Having considered the questions above (and checked out examples of learning policies), list 2-3 adjustments to your syllabus and policies you will consider/make as a result of this exercise.

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Analysis 3

Review Technology Policy for this course

- Is your technology policy aligned with your learning objectives for your course?
- Is this clearly outlined in your syllabus and do you make the time at the start of the semester to remind students of this?
- Does your technology policy allow for accommodations for students who require the use of technology in a way that is non-stigmatizing? How?
- Do you encourage students to speak with you in advance or inform you should they need to use their cell phones or laptops on a particular day to deal with an unavoidable emergency e.g. childcare, health issues, need to register for courses on a particular day during your class time?
- Might it be useful for your course/class to co-determine a policy with your students as part of a set of classroom guidelines that promotes a sense of ownership over their own learning?
- If you require students to use a particular device, tool, or application for assignments in your course, do you/your policy take into account students who may not have access to or familiarity with these? Do you make sure to make time and space to address such accessibility issues with such students at the beginning of class without making them feel stigmatized or judged?

See Appendix for more:

- “Choosing Your Classroom Technology Policy.” U Michigan. CRLT blog.

Your Revisions

Having considered the questions above (and checked out examples of learning policies), list 2-3 adjustments to your syllabus and policies you will consider/make as a result of this exercise.

1.

2.

3.

Analysis 4

Review late work policy for this course

- Are your policies about late work and missing assignments or exams in alignment with your course learning objectives/course outcomes? How?
- Are they clearly noted in your syllabus from day 1 of the semester? Have you had a conversation with them about the policy and taken any individual or collective concerns they might have had about them into consideration?
- Are due dates noted clearly on Canvas and/or syllabus from the start? Do you remind students of due dates at least 2-3 weeks before work is due?

- If you make any changes to the due dates do you make sure to inform the students in class and via email and make adequate accommodations so they have ample time to submit work by the new deadline without being penalized?
- Does this policy have a certain degree of flexibility built in to accommodate for when issues arise in students' lives and learning experiences that are unavoidable? How?
- Is there a way your late work policy might be constructive vs. punitive?
- Have you considered stacking the course for more low stakes assignments in the first few weeks so that students aren't destined to fail the course if they aren't up to speed in the first few assignments?

Your Revisions

Having considered the questions above (and checked out examples of late work policies), list 2-3 adjustments to your syllabus and policies you will consider/make as a result of this exercise.

1.

2.

3.

3. Designing Inclusive Courses: Inclusive learning goals and activities

Why inclusive learning goals?

The concept of inclusive learning goals gestures in two directions: a) toward objectives and methods that ensure that all students, regardless of background, have full opportunity to succeed, and b) toward discipline-specific learning outcomes that foreground inclusivity, diversity, and an understanding of the efforts of diverse people and communities to achieve full citizenship and self-determination and the social, cultural, economic, and historic forces that have enabled or restricted them.

Here we have indicated these two broad areas of inclusive learning as “Course design for inclusive learning” (focusing on equity in student success) and “Course design for inclusive disciplinary knowledge/skill” (focusing on teaching that foregrounds questions of diversity and equity within each discipline’s content and practices). A third and final section covers design of inclusive learning activities.

I. Course design for inclusive learning: Self-workshop

Step 1: Analysis:

Review syllabus and assignment instructions, with focus on learning outcomes and activities, applying the following questions:

•What assumptions about student background and circumstances are built into my learning outcomes?

Examples:

- Adequate time to complete homework?
- Access to adequate technology?
- Familiarity with rarely-expressed disciplinary practices, i.e. note-taking, highlighting, Socratic method, argumentation-as-analysis?
- Access to appropriate study spaces?
- Able-bodied status?
- Adequate resources to purchase books or other materials?

→ How can the range of students likely to succeed be increased by adapting to a wider array of student circumstances?

Examples:

- Multiple modes for engaging with content (written, video, lecture, podcast)
- Multiple modes for practicing skills and demonstrating mastery (written, verbal, public vs. private performance)?

→ **How can assumptions about student background and circumstances be made visible, if they cannot be eliminated?**

Example: “This course requires 3-5 hours of reading per week....”

•**What background knowledge and fundamental skill levels does the course assume students have upon entry?**

→ How can students with challenges in these areas succeed?

→ Have these expectations been made clear in course materials?

To what degree are my learning outcomes and activities implicitly addressed to an audience that is predominantly white, middle-class, cisgender and heterosexual, or composed of other normative identities?

Example: A course with the theme “The American Dream,” might, in its description and enunciation of course objectives, assume common understanding of and prior assent to this ideology, regardless of how critical the lens the course seeks to train on it.

→ How can I reframe course materials to relativize dominant conceptions and frame culture as multivocal?

Step 2: Revisions:

Having considered the questions above, list 3-5 adjustments to your syllabus, assessments, rubrics, or other course design elements that you will add, delete, or revise as a result of this exercise.

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

II. Course design for inclusive disciplinary knowledge/skill: self-workshop

As disciplines that study human agency, creativity, and history, the humanities are uniquely positioned for discipline-specific learning goals that enable students to inquire intellectually into the historic construction of difference and unequal power relations and the efforts of oppressed people to secure power and self-determination.

Step 1: Analysis.

Review learning objectives, assignments/assessments, and course materials (primary texts, lecture materials, textbooks) with the following questions in mind.

A. Disciplinary history review: Consider how the course/subdiscipline has traditionally dealt with difference and with historically marginalized communities.

- Consider foregrounding and making visible the ways in which the discipline has helped to construct difference, create exclusionary regimes, etc.
- How could the class be framed, for yourself, students, and others, as an intervention in redirecting the institutional roles of the discipline?

B: Syllabus review (1). Does course content (readings, lecture topics, films, etc.) represent diverse perspectives?

- Should primary texts representing diverse perspectives be added?
- How can the course's intellectual questions be reframed to accommodate multiple perspectives?
- To what extent does the traditional construction of the course's content and objectives make it challenging to include multiple perspectives? If so, how? How can this disciplinary history be mobilized as a teachable conflict? (See also Step 1).

C: Syllabus review (2): To what extent do course materials reproduce racism, sexism, or oppression of minority communities or silently marginalize underrepresented groups?

- To what extent do course materials silently reproduce dominant values?
- To what extent do course materials misrepresent or decontextualize issues related to traditionally underrepresented groups?
- To what extent do course materials reproduce stereotypes or other generalized attitudes towards traditionally underrepresented groups?

D. Syllabus review (3): To what extent do course content and learning activities enable students to analyze and articulate how cultures have constructed difference and how people from historically marginalized groups have contested cultural power and dominant narratives?

- To what extent is the course's traditional content amenable to pursuing these questions?
- How can the course's learning goals be adapted or reframed to provide space for inquiring into them?

E. Syllabus review (4): To what extent does course content foreground ideas or expressions from intersectional points of view?

- To what extent are cultural identities represented in course materials as static, stereotypical, generalized, simplified?
- What opportunities exist to include representations of cultural identities as intersectional, or to foreground intersectionality in course objectives?

F. Syllabus review (5): To what extent are dominant experiences centered in course content and historically marginalized or intersectional identities posited as a response or an exception?

→ How can the course re-frame culture as multi-vocal and differences as existing in dialogue, while recognizing and foregrounding power relations? How would this be conveyed in course objectives, assignments, units, framing of intellectual questions, etc.?

Step 2: Consider examples of inclusive learning outcomes, assessments, and activities

Read the following suggested learning outcomes and assessment practices. These are broad goals designed to be adapted to specific course content.

As appropriate to the discipline, level, and topic...

- Describe, analyze, critique the construction of cultural difference.
- Read with comprehension and articulate the ideas of critical race theory, gender theory, postcolonial theory.
- Analyze cultural artifacts—from artistic and cultural texts to cultural rhetorics to language itself—for the work they perform in constructing or critiquing whiteness and difference.
- Articulate and analyze the historical imbrication of the discipline itself in systems of power and inclusion/exclusion.
- Develop awareness of privilege and cultural positioning of one's self and others.
- Develop cultural competency, including
 - a culturally relativist lens that denaturalizes cultural norms and practices;
 - an awareness of strategies for dealing with people of other cultures with sensitivity and openness.

Inclusive learning activities and assessments

- "Authentic assessments" requiring negotiation, communication, problem-solving, and collaboration
- Writing and analysis prompts that foreground the construction of cultural difference and the cultural contestation over meaning, power, and values.
- Writing and analysis prompts that activate comprehension and application of analytical concepts from critical race theory, gender theory, postcolonial theory

- Course designs that allow student input on learning activities, selection of texts, themes, and emphases for discussion, and focus and design of final projects within the limits of the discipline and the content goals of the course.

Step 3: Revisions

- 1) Having considered the materials above, draft several learning objectives that can be added to, synthesized with, or substituted for existing learning objectives in your class.
- 2) Sketch out how you would put students in position to meet these learning objectives (e.g. texts, learning activities, questions posed, assessments)?

III. Course design for inclusive learning activities

“Learning activities” designate anything we ask students to do to mobilize their learning: reading, writing, creation of projects, homework, exercises, etc. Inclusive learning activities give all students equal access to these activities, eliminating barriers that make them inappropriate or non-productive for some students. This is not to suggest that difficulty is incompatible with learning: certain activities may be essential to important learning outcomes. But inclusive learning activities account for differences among students and provide support so that all can have the desired learning experiences.

Step 1. Analysis. Answer the following questions.

- To what extent do my current learning activities make for an inclusive learning environment?
- Do I have a prototypical student in mind for this course or level? How might I describe such a student?
- Are my assignments and readings all directed to serve this student? How?
- How might other students respond to these assignments? How can I help them succeed?
- Does my pedagogy follow universal design principles and ensure different modes of student participation – e.g. oral and written, named and anonymous, different sized group discussions – given that different students are comfortable with/have different expressive strengths and challenges when it comes to engaging with course material and class conversations? How?
- Are my assignment’s due dates culturally sensitive (i.e. not scheduled on religious holidays or non-American cultural festivals?)

See Appendix for examples of diverse learning and engagement options:

- Sample Assignment using UDL guideline Multiple Means of Expression. See Appendices p.64-65.
- *Best Practices in Alternative Assessments*. Ryerson University. See Appendices p.66-74. (Shared by DOSL, BSU during the Bootcamp for Multimodal Teaching and Learning in Summer 2020)

- Ball State's Inclusive Calendar for religious/cultural holidays - <https://www.bsu.edu/about/inclusive-excellence/faculty/calendar>
- Diversity Calendar for more inclusive holidays - <https://excellentpresence.com/5555/diversity-calendar-2021-multicultural-holidays/>

Your Revisions:

Having considered the questions above (and checked out examples of learning activities), list 2-3 adjustments to your lesson plans or course assignments you will consider/make as a result of this exercise.

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- .

4. Assessing and Grading Student Work Equitably

Inclusive Assessment

(aka multicultural assessment, culturally responsive assessment)

Assessment is an ongoing process aimed at understanding and improving student learning. It involves making our expectations explicit and public; setting appropriate and high standards for learning quality; systematically gathering, analyzing, and interpreting evidence to determine how well performance matches those expectations and standards; and using the resulting information to document, explain, and improve performance."

Angelo, T.A. (1995). Reassessing and defining assessment. *AAHE Bulletin*, 48(3): 14

Inclusive assessment often challenges our notion of fairness by asking us to think in terms of equity rather than equality. Shouldn't we be measuring students in the same manner if we are to be fair? That practice makes the assumption that all students are the same and therefore can be assessed the same way, an assumption we know has never been [true](#).

Inclusive assessment takes on even more importance when we hear student voices. A survey of student perceptions conducted by Mark Chesler at the University of Michigan uncovered the following themes:

- ❖ The faculty have low expectations for us – many students of color reported that faculty did not expect them to perform well in class
- ❖ The faculty do not understand that we are different from the white students in their class – some students of color reported that they felt estranged and even excluded by assumptions made by faculty about students in general that did not apply to them
- ❖ We are not all alike – in contrast students of color also experience being stereotyped or lumped together when they are not [alike](#)

Why inclusive assessment?

- ❖ Aims to provide equal academic opportunities for all students. It acknowledges that some students have characteristics, distinct from their academic ability, which can jeopardise their capacity to meet assessment requirements in a manner equal to their [peers](#)
- ❖ Supports learning for students of diverse backgrounds--BIPOC, international students, students with disabilities, nontraditional students, primary care givers, students with full time jobs, etc.
- ❖ Motivates and empowers students to take responsibility for their own learning

Questions for Self-Assessment

1. What do I know about the student population I am likely going to be working with?
2. Do I have access to demographic data, and course design reflecting this information? If not, who can I contact to get that information?
3. Based on what (I think) I know, what might I be assuming about students? How is that reflected in assessment? For instance, what assumptions does the pacing of my course make about the lives of the students in my class?
4. Do the standards of academic/philosophical practice I require or endorse help welcome students into the discipline (or do they in effect seem to serve more as gate-keeping devices)?
5. What is the most salient value I convey to students through my assessment?
6. Do I set up guidelines for interactions & discussions with or without student input?
7. How do I conceive of academic integrity?
8. Regarding my absence, late/missed work and accessibility policies: is the language I use to define these policies at risk of unfairly penalizing marginalized students?
9. How many ways and how often do I communicate requirements and deadlines?
10. How do I evaluate students and assess their growth in my course? Do any of these approaches raise concerns around assumptions, bias, discrimination, or exclusion?
11. How do I teach with transparency? What do I do to “lift the veil” on how students can succeed in class? In other words, how do I ensure that students understand and can meet requirements?
12. How do I determine final course grades? What subjective criteria such as effort, participation, and engagement factor into my grading practices? How might my current grading policies (like grading on a curve) create an environment of competition as opposed to one of collaboration? How do I encourage a growth mindset?

Below, we discuss two of the self-assessment questions in more detail, providing examples and further food for thought.

Analysis 1: How do I evaluate students and assess their growth?

Inclusive assessment begins by utilizing multiple and varied methods to evaluate students. This includes not only a combination of formative and summative assignments, but also a combination of creative, academic, and practical assignments.

Below are some suggested techniques and ideas that allow assessment to be a learning tool and give students the opportunity to demonstrate their learning in ways that honor and reflect differences.

Examples:

- Final Essay or Culminating Assignment Options
 - Digital Story or Essay – reflecting the goal of the course or assignment
 - Short Play or Dialogue – on a topic of significance
 - Verbal or Discussion Exam – students record their answers or discuss them with you in person
 - Action Oriented Project – students construct a project that reflects the goal of the course

- Testing/Quiz Options
 - Student generated test questions
 - Double Entry Journals (Entry 1. the idea; Entry 2. personal significance of the idea)
 - Audio Narrative – students record themselves talking through the process of solving a problem or answering a question

- On-going Class Assessment
 - Background Probe or Writing In – short questionnaire at the beginning of a unit/topic to determine the appropriate level of instruction
 - Minute Paper or Writing Out – end of the class question on unclear points
 - Concept Maps – students diagram the mental connections they make

Revisions

Using the above discussion and examples as inspiration, list 2-3 changes you can implement to make your assignments more inclusive and your assessment more equitable:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Analysis 2: How do I teach with transparency?

Teaching with transparency ensures students understand the purpose, task(s), and criteria for a specific assignment, so that all students have the opportunity to meet course objectives. This approach has [proven especially beneficial to underserved student populations](#), resulting in increased academic confidence, greater sense of belonging, and improved mastery of soft skills that employers value (as well as higher rates of retention). Transparent teaching involves spending time discussing assignment processes and goals beforehand, so students spend less time figuring out how to do an assignment and more time doing it.

Below are some suggested strategies and ideas for developing a more transparent pedagogy in order to foster more equitable assessment.

- Use rubrics to clarify grading criteria and expectations
- Provide student samples to help fill knowledge gaps and even the playing field
- Create problem-center assignments that encourage student engagement
- Discuss skills and knowledge students will gain by completing the assignment and how those skills and knowledge relate to students' lives
- Discuss expectations and processes--ensure students know *how* to complete the assignment.

Revisions

Using the above discussion and examples as inspiration, list 2-3 changes you can implement to make your teaching (or a specific assignment) more transparent:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Equitable Grading

Analysis 1: How do I determine final course grades?

Traditional approaches to grading frequently perpetuate achievement disparities. For example, professors often calculate grades by averaging a student's performance over time, which can disadvantage students who enter the class with less prior knowledge. Subjective components of student grades, such as participation and effort, can also unfairly represent a student's performance in class. Such approaches often discourage and disempower students, leading them to prioritize their grade over their learning experience.

Below are some suggested strategies to help ensure grading processes incentivize and adequately reflect student learning.

Examples:

- Offering flexible late work policies, such as a finite number of 24-hour “passes”
- Dropping lowest grades (quizzes, homework, discussion boards, etc.)
- Giving students a choice on dropped assignments
- Encouraging students to revise and resubmit assignments or redo modules
- Utilizing alternative grading Practices
 - Labor Based Grading Contracts or Contract Grading emphasizes writing processes and labor as much or more than final products. This often includes:
 - Collaborating with students to define assessment criteria
 - Requiring and reviewing student Labor Logs
 - Foregrounding feedback and revision
 - Encouraging student self-assessment
 - *See Appendix for example
 - Specifications Grading, or grading assignments on a pass/fail basis. This often includes:
 - Providing very clear specifications of what constitutes acceptable (passing) work, which reflects the standards and quality of work that would traditionally merit a B grade
 - Offering students at least one opportunity to revise unacceptable work.
 - Grouping work into modules (units that must be completed in order) or bundles (units that do not require an order) that are linked to explicit course learning objectives
 - Grading modules or bundles are graded as a single pass/fail measure to demonstrate mastery of particular learning objectives
 - *see Appendix for example

Revisions

Using the above examples as inspiration, list 2-3 changes you can implement to make your grading more equitable:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Other Tools for Self Assessment

- ❖ [Tufts Inclusive Assessment Chart](#)
 - Read through the above chart. Included in the first column are some of the things that many of us do. Check those that apply to you. Included in the second column are new approaches you might like to try as well as ideas for how you might enhance what you already do by using more inclusive, student-centered language. Check those that you might like to adopt or adapt.

- ❖ [The C.A.P \(Creative. Academic. Practical\) Model of Assessment](#)

- ❖ [Assao Inoue's Antiracist Writing Assessment Ecology](#): Power, Parts, Purposes, People, Processes, Products, and Places.

Appendix 1: Ball State Classroom Accountability Toolkit

The purpose of this toolkit is to guide Ball State University faculty in facilitating classroom accountability by adapting strategies to the courses they teach.

Although Ball State strives to respond to events in our learning spaces in a consistent manner, the unique facts and circumstances of each situation may lead the campus to adjust the actions suggested below in the best interest of all of our students.

Contents

[Introduction](#)

[Guiding Principles](#)

[Terminology / Definition](#)

[Responding to Disruption in University Learning Spaces](#)

[Framework for Classroom Accountability](#)

[Distracting, Disrupting, & Dangerous Behavior](#)

[General Principles for Responding to Disruption](#)

[Minimizing Disruptive Behavior](#)

[Responding to Disruptive Behavior](#)

[Examples of Guidelines for Discussion](#)

[Guidelines for Classroom Interactions](#)

[Examples for Community Expectations](#)

[Additional Considerations](#)

[University Resources](#)

[Additional Resources](#)

[Works Cited](#)

Introduction

This toolkit outlines policy, protocols, and suggested guidance regarding classroom accountability. Classroom accountability is the responsibility of all members in our community. By holding oneself, peers, and those over which they have influence accountable, we help maintain a safe and productive learning environment for all.

Guiding Principles

- We value and are committed to learning and teaching excellence, innovation, integrity, courage, gratitude, social responsibility, equity, and inclusion. Fostering and maintaining inclusive, culturally responsive learning environments will help us realize the enduring values from our Beneficence Pledge.
- Students and University personnel should be empowered to actively engage in the learning process; to learn from mistakes and be provided with opportunities to acquire knowledge and skills to respect and embrace equity, inclusion, and diversity in people, ideas, and opinions.
- Classroom disruptions and negative interactions seldom exist in a vacuum. Rather, they reflect the implicit and explicit norms, values, and practices rooted in these learning spaces and within the University.
- There are ripple effects when students do not feel and/or are not included, valued, or supported in the learning community that have repercussions for the classroom to the community and beyond. Negative experiences affect not just the individuals involved but can exact significant costs to the University's reputation, locally, nationally, and internationally.

- We all benefit when there is mutual trust and accountability in learning spaces and when students feel empowered to actively contribute and are integral members of the learning community.
 - Pedagogical benefits – Increased teaching effectiveness when students are actively engaged.
 - Social justice – Increased equity of access to educational opportunities and resources.
 - Moral values – Increased fulfillment of ethical commitment to treat people with dignity, fairness, and respect.
 - Building civil society – Increased number of future leaders and global citizens who embody civility and cultural inclusiveness.
 - Economic benefits – Increased student enrollment and retention.
- Although acknowledging the power differential between students and University personnel, collaboration in the process of establishing expectations and norms ensure mutual understanding of and respect for all members in the learning spaces.
- We believe these recommendations, guidance, and existing policies can help guide University personnel and students to be proactive in ensuring that learning spaces are inclusive and supportive.
- University personnel will consult the toolkit and continually work to enhance their knowledge, skills, and awareness to advance community-building.

Terminology / Definition

- Disruption: any “behavior a reasonable person would view as being likely to substantially or repeatedly interfere with the conduct of” learning spaces. Disruptions should be distinguished from the more serious incidents that are a danger and the less serious ones that are a distraction (Sterling-Turner, Robinson, & Wilczynski, 2001). The physical, psychological, emotional, and cultural backgrounds and diversities of all individuals should be considered when determining whether behaviors are disruptive.
- Learning spaces: The distinction has been made between formal and informal learning spaces. Longman (2010) identifies a “traditional” account of learning spaces, as embodied in classrooms and lecture halls, in which teaching, learning, and management strategies are integral. Informal learning spaces are learning environments that do not meet the physical

criteria of learning spaces (Graetz, 2006; Long & Ehrmann, 2005). However, we define learning spaces as including both formal and informal settings and occurring in person and online.

- Inclusive excellence: Inclusive Excellence (IE) was developed by experts at the Association of American Colleges and Universities (AAC&U) as a way to re-imagine diversity and inclusion as the active process of making excellence inclusive and the responsibility of everyone. They note, “The action of making excellence inclusive requires that we uncover inequities in student (faculty and staff) success, identify effective educational (and operational) practices, and build such practices organically for sustained institutional change.”

- Classroom accountability versus classroom management: Instead of faculty “managing” the behavior of students, student and faculty mutually define appropriate classroom parameters for an optimal learning environment in light of the Beneficence Pledge and the University’s stated commitment to Inclusive Excellence.

- Culturally responsive pedagogy: This pedagogical approach requires teachers as part of their classroom practices to recognize and empathize with students’ unique cultural backgrounds (Ladson-Billings, 2014; Warren 2018).

Responding to Disruption in University Learning Spaces

Recommended Guidance December 8, 2020

1. Purpose

1.1 At Ball State, faculty and staff welcome students into a community with shared values of learning and teaching excellence, academic honesty, social responsibility, equity, and inclusion as outlined in the [Beneficence Pledge](#) and the [Inclusive Excellence Plan](#). This document is designed to provide faculty and other University personnel guidance in responding to disruption in university learning spaces. Disruption by a student in a Ball State learning space is a violation of the [Code of Student Rights and Responsibilities](#), specifically

4.2.8 Obstruction or Disruption: Obstructing or disrupting the teaching and/or learning process in any campus classroom, building, or meeting area, or any University-sponsored event or activity, pedestrian or vehicular traffic, classes, lectures, or meetings; obstructing or restricting another person’s freedom of movement; or inciting, aiding, or encouraging other persons to do so. Note: obstruction or disruption as prohibited here only occurs on campus or in relation to a University-sponsored event or activity including but not limited to field trips, athletic events, study abroad, or alumni events.

2. Definitions

2.1 Disruption is defined as any “behavior a reasonable person would view as being likely to substantially or repeatedly interfere with the conduct of” ^[1] learning spaces.

2.1.1 Disruptions should be distinguished from the more serious incidents that are a danger and the less serious ones that are a distraction (Sterling-Turner, Robinson, and Wilczynski, 2001). ^[2] Some behaviors or single incidents of some behaviors are not the focus of this policy. These include but are not limited to coming late to or leaving early from class, tapping fingers, eating, reading unrelated materials, and using electronic devices without authorization. While annoying and distracting, these usually can be addressed effectively through culturally responsive classroom accountability techniques that include addressing behavior expectations in the syllabus and during the first class meeting, in-class intervention, and speaking to a student after class.

2.1.2 However, students who exhibit behaviors listed above and who *do not respond to reasonable intervention or fail to comply with reasonable instructions* (see section 3 for intervention guidelines), who exhibit more severe behaviors, or who violate another University policy in an academic setting (e.g., intoxication, weapons policy violation) should be referred for adjudication through procedures outlined in the [Code of Student Rights and Responsibilities](#). Such behaviors include but are not limited to

- a. repeated and unauthorized use of cell phones or other electronic devices
- b. persistent speaking without being called upon or disregarding instructor’s requests
- c. seeking to be distracting through noise or movement; or
- d. engaging in behaviors reasonable people consider dangerous, including making physical or verbal threats.

2.2 Learning spaces include but are not limited to classrooms, laboratories, studios, and lecture halls where teaching, learning and management strategies are integral. Learning spaces also include informal learning environments not bound by physical criteria, such as a field trip or a community-building program held outside. Finally, please note that learning spaces can be in person and online.

3. Guidelines for Intervening When Disruption Occurs

3.1 Faculty members, through culturally responsive ^[3] classroom accountability techniques (see Toolkit below), should take steps to de-escalate and resolve the disruption. In most cases, actively using de-escalation methods will conclude the incident without a high risk for repeated disruption in the future. Once multiple de-escalation attempts have been made, faculty members and administrators have the authority to instruct the student to temporarily leave the academic setting when a

student fails to comply with reasonable standards and faculty instructions. To be clear, asking a student to leave should not be the first attempt at resolution. If a student is asked to leave, the student should be told the reason for this request and instructed to communicate with the instructor or administrator prior to returning to the next class. The instructor should consult promptly with the department chair or designee. The faculty member will then choose one of the next two options for resolution:

3.1.1 If the faculty member and/or department chairperson believes that the situation is reconcilable, a conference between the faculty member and the student should be held outside of the classroom. The faculty member and the student may want to consider having a third party observe and help facilitate the conference. The event resulting in removal from the classroom should be discussed. The discussion should include consequences for continued disrupting behavior as well as the strategies that can be employed for ending such behavior. At the conclusion of this meeting, the incident and its resolution should be documented by submitting a report to www.bsu.edu/saysomething (select Student Conduct Referral and nature as Information Only). The faculty member is able to copy other administrators on this report based on department/college policy.

3.1.2 If the faculty member/department cannot resolve the situation, an incident report should be filed with the Office of Student Conduct to review the situation for potential violations of the Code. The reporter may be the involved faculty member or academic staff person, the department chair, a witness to the event, or any other knowledgeable third-party, including students. Upon receipt of the incident report, the Office of Student Conduct will proceed as described in section V.6 of the [Code of Student Rights and Responsibilities](#).

3.2 If there is an immediate and serious perceived danger or act of violence, the faculty member should dismiss the class and go to a safe place to call for help. University Police should be contacted by dialing (765) 285-1111 or 5-1111 (from a campus phone). Once the immediate threat is resolved, the reporter should submit an incident report to the Office of Student Conduct for review.

This guidance does not replace or modify facility usage policies already in place (e.g., University Libraries, Student Recreation and Wellness Center, residence halls). These policies vary to meet the unique needs of students in these environments and disruptions in those environments may be handled by procedures outlined in these policies.

Framework for Classroom Accountability

Classroom accountability and the development of inclusive learning environments requires commitment from all levels of the university. The following socio-ecological model below describes the interconnected roles of entities on campus. True commitment to the [Beneficence Pledge](#) means embracing [inclusive excellence](#).

- INDIVIDUALS are asked to take an active role in contributing to classroom accountability.
- PEERS are empowered to hold each other accountable in ways consistent with the Beneficence Pledge "to act in a socially responsible way" and "to value the intrinsic worth of every member of the community."
- INSTRUCTORS should establish expectations for accountability by creating consistent messaging and practices and engaging students in feedback.
- COLLEGE and DEPARTMENT provides instructors ongoing access to resources, training, assessment, feedback, and guidance. Department chairs promote classroom accountability through moderation, mediation, and facilitation of communication among faculty and students.
- UNIVERSITY policy will establish clear and consistent directives, policy expectations and process for classroom accountability. Guidance will provide suggested recommendations and resources to personnel responding to disruptions in learning spaces.

Distracting, Disrupting, & Dangerous Behavior

The following document is intended as a guide that can and should be adapted by the user. The examples below are intended to provide context for application and is not a "one size fits all" approach. Faculty should consider if the behavior demonstrated is distracting or disrupting to them personally versus impacting the larger community. Consider whether addressing the behavior during class creates a larger distraction than the original behavior.



<p>EXAMPLE BEHAVIOR</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Repeated behavior which disrupts the flow of instruction or concentration, (e.g., outbursts, incessant questions/comments) 2. Failure to cooperate in maintaining classroom decorum 3. Text messaging or the continued use of any electronic or other noise or light emitting device which disturbs others (e.g., disturbing noises from cell phones, mobile devices, computers, etc.) 4. Consistently arriving late and/or leaving early or sleeping 5. Known or suspected alcohol or drug abuse 	<p>FACULTY RESPONSE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ Request the student to stop the behavior. ▶ Arrange to talk with the student privately about the behavior. ▶ If behavior continues, remind student of previous discussion regarding sanctions should behavior continue. ▶ Referrals can also be made to campus resources. ▶ Document situation and private conversations. 	<p>PRIVATE CONVERSATION</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Clearly state the behavior expected and consequences/sanctions for rule violation. (This is a reminder of behavior expectations from your syllabus and classroom discussion) 2. Listen to student's response(s) and take notes. Ask clarifying questions. Repeat as necessary until student confirms they have shared their perspective. 3. Summarize the student's perspective. 4. Be specific about the behavior that is disruptive and how it impacts others. 5. Acknowledge student's strength(s) and your support for their success. 6. Offer resources for academic skills and life issues. 7. Clearly explain the specific expectations and plan for if behavior continues. (see Moderate Level) 	<p>HINTS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ Reflect on which behaviors are personally distracting or disruptive to you but do not negatively affect the other students or the learning space. ▶ Reflect on which students tend to evoke stronger reactions. Consider external reasons for students' behaviors. ▶ Repeated low level behaviors can escalate to moderate or high level concerns. It is best to pre-plan how you may manage inappropriate / disruptive classroom behaviors. ▶ Written documentation includes description of what happened, what was said, when it happened, who was involved, and what actions were taken. Write objectively and give a factual accounting of what happened in a nonjudgmental manner ▶ Enforce expectations and consequences consistently
---	--	---	---

REPEATED LOW LEVEL BEHAVIORS

<p>EXAMPLE BEHAVIOR</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Repeated Low Level behaviors 2. Offensive language used to disrupt class. 3. Verbal or written harassment 4. Inappropriate emails: high quantity, unreasonable expectations of faculty responses, extremely personal stories or other topics not germane to course, use of moderate expletives 	<p>FACULTY RESPONSE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ Consult with department chair, academic dean, dean of students or director of student conduct for support. ▶ If student was removed from class, direct student to meet with appropriate staff ▶ Document situation. ▶ For situations involving general harassment or discrimination, consult the Office of Student Conduct. ▶ For situations involving sexual harassment or discrimination report concerns to the Title IX Coordinator. 	<p>PRIVATE CONVERSATION</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ If a low level behavior has occurred repeatedly, it may be due to either a need to self-regulate or a desire for attention. Consider repeating the private conversation process again, listening carefully for these two possible explanations. This information may be helpful as you consult with the department chair, academic dean, dean of students or director of student conduct for support. 	<p>HINTS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ Have a plan in mind before you need one ▶ Consistently enforce expectations and consequences ▶ Consider altering class expectations by leading a class wide discussion and reminding participants how all voices are encouraged to participate. One option to suggest is limiting the number of questions any students can ask during class if one or two students dominate discussion or ask too many questions that disrupt the flow of instruction/discussion. Ask students who have additional questions to meet you after class or email their questions to you.
---	--	--	---

<p>EXAMPLE BEHAVIOR</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Extreme verbal or written harassment. 2. Extremes, or changes in, appearance such as looking disheveled, disoriented, extreme low energy or apathetic. 3. Disturbing writings or vague discussions involving suicide or violence (past or future) fixation or focus on harm or violence. 4. Signs of paranoia or making references that are not germane to the topic or not related to the situational context. 5. Clearly under the influence of drugs/alcohol. 	<p>FACULTY RESPONSE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ If no immediate threat, contact the Dean of Students if consult is needed or provide written documentation to BIT at www.bsu.edu/saysomething. <p>DOS RESPONSE</p> <p>A member of the team may contact you for additional information. They may also contact the student and assess the risk to self and others and respond appropriately.</p>	<p>PRIVATE CONVERSATION</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ It is appropriate for a faculty member to share their concern for the student’s wellbeing. ▶ In certain situations, it is also appropriate for the faculty member to let the student know that they shared their concern with “someone who can help.” 	<p>HINTS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ Prepare a plan and mentally practice your planned response. ▶ Do not let your emotions escalate to that of the student; keep as calm as possible. ▶ Trust your instincts.
		<p style="text-align: center;">Additional Items:</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Submit reports/referrals at www.bsu.edu/saysomething Office of the Dean of Students • 765.285.1545 • dos@bsu.edu Office of Student Conduct • 765-285-5036 • conduct@bsu.edu University Police • emergency # 765-285-1111 or 911</p>	
<p>EXAMPLE BEHAVIOR</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Imminent danger of hurting self or others. 	<p>FACULTY REPONSE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ Tell student to leave the classroom; if noncompliant - ▶ Call University Police at ext. 5-1111 ▶ If danger is imminent, call 5-1111 or 911. ▶ Dismiss class if necessary. ▶ Document incident at www.bsu.edu/saysomething 		

General Principles for Responding to Disruption

Preventing Disruption ^[4]

- Assume that most students want to help create positive learning environments.
- State clear behavior expectations on the syllabus. For example, if you want students to turn off their cell phones during class, say so. Before making that decision, realize that some students may require their phone to provide supports (e.g., recording parts of class for someone with auditory processing difficulties, looking up words you use during lecture that are not commonly used in their communities, etc.)

- Invest time during the first-class meeting to discuss and clarify standards for conduct in your classroom including the behaviors that will help to create an effective learning environment versus those that will obstruct learning. The setting of expectations ideally results from a conversation with the class, with students suggesting expectations and identifying their role in classroom accountability.
- Serve as a role model for the conduct you expect from your students.

Intervening When Disruption Occurs

- Intervene early when behavior first occurs.
- Utilize a gradual progressive response.
- Be clear, courteous, and fair.
- Focus on the details of the disruptive behavior when speaking to the student instead of a student's "attitude" or other attributes that are subject to interpretation
- Document incidents when they occur. Document even small incidents and your response, as this may be important to establishing a pattern of behavior; sometimes, small incidents assume greater importance at a later time. Document date, time, location, the names of persons involved, what you observed, and how you and others responded. Incidents that are adjudicated through procedures outlined in the *Code of Student Rights and Responsibilities* require a written complaint.
- Consult with your department chair and the Office of Student Conduct (OSC), Student Center L-4, 765-285-5036, if necessary. OSC can help by reviewing Ball State disciplinary procedures and meet with accused students informally or formally. Complete documentation as needed.

Response Illustration

- Use a general word of caution to the entire class rather than warning a particular student and remind students of the mutually developed expectations and the reason these expectations exist (i.e., enhance learning for all students).
- Make eye contact with the student who is being disruptive and communicate non-verbally that behavior should stop.
- Request student who is being disruptive to speak to you after class in a firm, respectful and non-threatening manner.
- Only very rarely should you speak to a student during class about their behavior. Instructors or faculty should pause and consider the risk of escalating behavior before doing so. If compelled to address a student during class, correct the student with courtesy,

indicating that further discussion can occur after class. Keep in mind that other students will expect you to be reasonable and fair in their response.

- If disruption persists, the student may be asked to leave the class for the remainder of the period. The student should be told the reason for this request and be given an opportunity to meet with you at a scheduled time of mutual convenience prior to the next class period. The instructor should consult promptly with the department chair and the Office of Student Conduct prior to meeting with the student.
- Few faculty members will ever encounter a situation that requires calling University Police. However, if you perceive there to be a serious danger of harm to self or others, or an act of violence, the class should be adjourned. The faculty member should go to a safe place and call the University Police (765-285-1111 or 5-1111 when calling from a campus phone). This call should be followed by immediate contact with the department chair and submission of an incident to the Office of Student Conduct for review.

Minimizing Disruptive Behavior^[5]

- Define expectations early in writing and verbally: The communication of policies, requirements, and expectations on the first day of class via multiple modalities is an important practice. Respectful and transparent dialogue regarding policies and expectations establishes the beginning of a relationship between instructor and students, allows for clarification and student input as appropriate, and sets a tone for the learning environment; dialogue can be accomplished both face to face and via online formats such as video chat. Posting the mutually agreed upon expectations in Canvas can emphasize the shared desire for classroom accountability.
- Decrease anonymity: Faculty who get to know their students, which is part of relationship building, tend to have less conflict in the classroom.
- Encourage active learning: Classes in which students participate in collaborative learning tend to have fewer instances of incivility and unethical behavior. When a sense of the classroom as a learning community guided by inclusive excellence has been established, students tend to take more responsibility for themselves and to hold each other accountable for behavior.
- Seek feedback from students: Students who feel heard and respected are more civil and accountable. Faculty who seek feedback about class from all students provide everyone an opportunity to share their thoughts, which faculty can then utilize to improve their teaching in tangible ways. Obtaining feedback midway through the term allows faculty to increase modes of information delivery that are effective and decrease those that are less effective to positively impact the learning environment.

Responding to Disruptive Behavior

- Address the behavior immediately but sensitively: Both faculty and students agree that ignoring classroom incivility is not an effective technique for stopping the behavior.
- Utilize conflict reduction strategies: Conflict resolution strategies allow both faculty and student to develop a long-term solution that is mutually acceptable.
- Refer students to campus resources.
- Be willing to end the class: One of the recommended techniques for handling classroom disruptions is ending the class. If attempts to address a problem result in further escalation, the faculty member may opt to end the class and reconvene at the next class period in order to diffuse the tension.

Examples of Guidelines for Discussion [6][7][8]

Guidelines for Classroom Interactions

Any of the following could provide a useful starting point for an instructor planning to use discussion guidelines in their course. (add discipline specific statement)

- Share responsibility for including all voices in the conversation. If you tend to have a lot to say, make sure you leave sufficient space to hear from others. If you tend to stay quiet in group discussions, challenge yourself to contribute so others can learn from you.
- Listen respectfully. Don't interrupt, turn to technology, or engage in private conversations while others are speaking unless it helps you engage more effectively in class activities. Use attentive, courteous body language. Comments that you make (whether asking for clarification, sharing critiques, or expanding on a point) should reflect that you have paid attention to the previous speakers' comments.
- Be open to changing your perspectives based on what you learn from others. Try to explore new ideas and possibilities. Think critically about the factors that have shaped your perspectives. Seriously consider points-of-view that differ from your current thinking.
- Understand that we are bound to make mistakes in this space, as anyone does when approaching complex tasks or learning new skills. Strive to see your mistakes and others' as valuable elements of the learning process.
- Understand that your words have effects on others. Speak with care. If you learn that something you have said was experienced as disrespectful or marginalizing, listen carefully and try to understand that perspective. Learn how you can do better in the future.
- Take collaborative learning (pair work or small group) work seriously. Remember that your peers' learning is partly dependent on your engagement.
- Understand that others will come to these discussions with different experiences from yours. Be careful about assumptions and generalizations you make based only on your own experience. Be open to hearing and learning from other perspectives. The quality of your education is higher when you hear from people whose views or lived experiences are different than your own.
- Make an effort to get to know other students. Introduce yourself to students sitting near you. Refer to classmates by name and make eye contact with other students.

- Understand that there are different approaches to solving problems. If you are uncertain about someone else's approach, ask a question to explore areas of uncertainty. Listen respectfully to how and why the approach could work.

Examples for Community Expectations

- Discretion and Privacy. We want to create an atmosphere for open, honest exchange.
- Our primary commitment is to learn from each other. We will listen to each other and not talk at each other. We acknowledge differences amongst us in backgrounds, skills, interests, and values. There is no "standard" background, skill level, interests, or values so every member of our community has something valuable to share. We realize that it is these very differences that will increase our awareness of relevant issues in our communities and the world and that our increased understanding means we are better prepared to make meaningful contributions once we graduate from Ball State University.
- We will not demean, devalue, or "put down" people for their experiences, lack of experiences, or difference in interpretation of those experiences.
- We will trust that people are doing the best they can. We will try not to 'freeze people in time' (i.e., assume they are the same person they were when we shared the previous class) but leave space for everyone to learn and change through our interactions with one another.
- Challenge the idea and not the person. If we wish to challenge something that has been said, we will challenge the idea or the practice referred to, not the individual sharing this idea or practice.
- Speak your discomfort. If something is bothering you, please share this with the group. Often our emotional reactions to this process offer the most valuable learning opportunities.
- Speak up then step back. Be mindful of taking up much more space than others. On the same note, empower yourself to speak up when others are dominating the conversation.
- Mindfully avoid microaggressions and managing them when they occur in the classroom. (refer to additional resources). Microaggressions are slights (verbal and nonverbal) against members of marginalized groups that may undermine their contributions to a dialogue or demean a member of a community. Microaggressions often result from implicit bias, can occur repeatedly in the day, week, life of the member of the marginalized community, and result in emotional pain, frustration, or withdrawal. "Microaggressions are verbal and nonverbal interpersonal exchanges in which a perpetrator causes harm to a member of a marginalized group, whether intended or unintended. These brief and commonplace indignities communicate hostile, derogatory, and/or negative slights, which often result in emotional and psychological trauma and withdrawal" (Sue & Spanierman, *Microaggressions in Everyday Life*, 2020). Examples include but are not restricted to: (a) assuming a student has committed plagiarism because you did not expect them to use complex language given their background; (b) asking a student where they are "from" because they are not White; (c) asking a classmate if you can touch their hair; (d) students breaking up tasks on a group project on the basis of gender expectations, etc.
- Encouraging discussion when mistakes (such as microaggressions) occur by using strategies supported by the [Office of Inclusive Excellence](#) and the [Multicultural Center](#).

Additional Considerations

Optional Syllabus Statement Examples:

In this course, faculty will engage in communication with students to mutually define and/or align on appropriate parameters for our optimal learning environment in light of the Beneficence Pledge. After reaching consensus in identifying “disruptive” classroom behavior, we will all share accountability for maintaining an optimal environment.

Consideration for Communication Addressing/Reporting Behavior

When emailing the student about their behavior, consider the following:

- Restate the facts: what was the behavior, when did it occur, etc.
- Include the impact of the behavior (e.g. class was stopped to address the behavior, 3 people reported being unable to concentrate due to their behavior, etc.)
- Describe the behavior expected moving forward (Based on our class agreement, you should refrain from answering your phone during class).
- Remember, you don’t want the individual to feel “sold” out. Avoid:
 - Speculations and Stereotypes
 - Opinions
 - Labels
 - Diagnoses

When documenting the situation, consider the following:

- Write about the facts: the who, what, where, when, and how.
- Include the impact of the behavior. This can include things such as:
 - Students left the room.
 - You felt scared for your physical safety.
 - 3 people reported being unable to concentrate for 30 minutes after the incident.
- Describe any attempts to intervene, discuss, or mitigate the issue and how the person responded to that.
- While your privacy can be protected for situations where physical safety is at risk, write as if the person you are referring might ultimately read the referral.
- Remember that reports may be subject to disclosure through FERPA, FOIA, subpoenas or other means.
- You don't want the individual to feel "sold" out. Avoid:
 - Speculations and Stereotypes
 - Opinions
 - Labels
 - Diagnoses

Use the following checklist to ensure you have provided a comprehensive report:

- A - About the Person - any known information about the individual
 - Name
 - ID Number

- Course enrollment
- B - Behavior/Basis - what has been observed/ the reason for referral
 - Actions
 - Words used
 - Tone of Voice
 - Body Language
 - Frequency - how often it occurred?
 - Duration - how long it lasted?
- C - Context - the setting(s) for the behavior(s)
 - When
 - Where
 - Unique factors of the environment
 - Prior interactions with the individual
- D - Details - any other relevant information
 - Names of any witnesses
 - Any other information that may be relevant
- E - Effect - the impact(s) of the behavior(s)
 - Measures of disruption to teaching or learning
 - Descriptions of emotions felt as a result
 - Indicators of disruption to office environments
- F- Follow Up - any responses/attempts to intervene
 - Actions taken to intervene/address the behavior
 - Responses from the individual
 - Any documentation of the incident
 - Anyone else who has been notified about the incident

University Resources

[Ball State Multicultural Center](#)

[Division of Online and Strategic Learning](#)

[Office of Inclusive Excellence](#)

Additional Resources

Collaborative Learning:

<https://www.evergreen.edu/sites/default/files/facultydevelopment/docs/WhatisCollaborativeLearning.pdf>

<https://globaldigitalcitizen.org/7-websites-build-collaborative-classrooms>

<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S1041608008000861?via%3Dihub>

Implicit Bias:

<https://www.edutopia.org/article/look-implicit-bias-and-microaggressions>

<http://www.seedtheway.com/publications.html>

Microaggressions:

<http://otl.du.edu/wp-content/uploads/2013/03/MicroAggressionsInClassroom-DUCME.pdf>

<https://teaching.washington.edu/topics/inclusive-teaching/addressing-microaggressions-in-the-classroom/>

Works Cited

Brookfield, S. D., & Preskill, S. (2012). *Discussion as a Way of Teaching: Tools and Techniques for Democratic Classrooms*. Wiley.

Graetz, K. A. (2006). The psychology of learning environments. *EDUCAUSE*, 41, 6, 60–75.

Long, P. D. & Ehrmann, S. C. (2005). Future of the learning space. Breaking out of the box. *EDUCAUSE Review*, July/August 2005, 42–58.

Sensoy, Ö., & DiAngelo, A. (2014). Respect Differences? Challenging the Common Guidelines in Social Justice Education. *Democracy and Education*, 22(2), Article 1. Available at: <https://democracyeducationjournal.org/home/vol22/iss2/1>

Sterling-Turner, H. E., Robinson, S. L., & Wilczynski, S. M. (2001). Functional Assessment of Distracting and Disruptive Behaviors in the School Setting. *School Psychology Review*, 30(2), 211-226. doi:10.1080/02796015.2001.12086110

Sue, D. W., & Spanierman, L. (2020). Microaggressions in everyday life.

Thomas, H. (2010). Learning spaces, learning environments and the displacement of learning. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 41(3), 502-511. doi:10.1111/j.1467-8535.2009.00974.x

Williams, D., Berger, J., & McClendon, S. (2005). *Toward a Model of Inclusive Excellence and Change in ...* Retrieved November 6, 2020, from https://aacu.org/sites/default/files/files/mei/williams_et_al.pdf

[1] This and other parts of this policy are adapted from Pavela, G. (July 18, 2001). Questions and answers on classroom disruption. *ASJA Law & Policy Report*, 26. Association for Student Conduct Administrators (formerly Association for Student Judicial Affairs).

- [2] Sterling-Turner, H. E., Robinson, S. L., & Wilczynski, S. M. (2001). Functional assessment of distracting and disrupting behaviors in the school setting. *School Psychology Review, 30*(2), 211-226, doi:10.1080/02796015.2001.12086110
- [3] Weinstein, Tomlinson-Clarke and Curran (2004) developed a five-part concept of culturally responsive classroom management that was informed by culturally responsive teaching, counseling psychology and care ethics. The elements are: “(1) Recognition of One’s Own Cultural Lens and Biases; (2) Knowledge of Students’ Cultural Backgrounds; (3) Awareness of the Broader, Social, Economic and Political Context; (4) Ability and Willingness to Use Culturally Appropriate Management Strategies; and (5) Commitment to Building Caring Classroom Communities.” Weinstein C., Tomlinson-Clarke S., & Curran M. (2004). Toward a conception of culturally responsive classroom management. *Journal of Teacher Education, 55*(1), 25-38.
- [4] An excellent and accessible monograph from which these principle are derived is [Amada, Gerald. \(2015\). *Coping with misconduct in the college classroom: A practical model*. Biographical Publishing Company, Prospect CT.](#)
- [5] Adapted from Ladeji-Osias, J. O., & Wells, A. M. (2014). Best Practices in Classroom Management for Today’s University Environment. 121st ASEE Annual Conference & Exposition. Indianapolis: ASEE.
- [6] Adapted from “Guidelines For Classroom Interactions.” CRLT, crlt.umich.edu/examples-discussion-guidelines.
- [7] Adapted from Brookfield, S. D., & Preskill, S. (2012). *Discussion as a Way of Teaching: Tools and Techniques for Democratic Classrooms*. Wiley.
- [8] Adapted from Sensoy, Ö., & DiAngelo, A. (2014). Respect Differences? Challenging the Common Guidelines in Social Justice Education. *Democracy and Education, 22*(2), Article 1. Available at: <https://democracyeducationjournal.org/home/vol22/iss2/1>

Appendix – Section 2
Creating Inclusive Learning Environments



THE UNIVERSITY
OF ARIZONA

Diversity and Inclusiveness in the Classroom

Jesús Treviño, Ph.D.
Vice Provost for Inclusive Excellence
University of Arizona

Office for Diversity and Inclusive Excellence
University of Arizona

Diversity and Inclusiveness in the Classroom

With the increase in diversity at institutions of higher education, campus communities are now commonly comprised of individuals from many backgrounds and with diverse experiences as well as multiple and intersecting identities. In addition, many campus constituents have social identities that historically have been underrepresented (e.g. Black/African Americans, Latinx/Chicanx/Hispanic, Asian American/Pacific Islanders, Natives Americans, LGBTQIA+ folks, international students and employees, people with diverse religious affiliations, veterans, non-traditional students, women, first-generation college students, and people from lower socioeconomic backgrounds). The University of Arizona does not differ from other institutions when it comes to diversity. Considering race and ethnicity alone, currently the UA has over 40% students of color. The multiplicity of the groups mentioned above form a valuable part of our student body.

Diversity poses both challenges and opportunities for a college campus. One place where this is certainly true is the college classroom. With respect to challenges, faculty and students continuing to experience conflict and tension related to the different views, perceptions, and backgrounds represented in the classroom. Here are some potential examples:

- a heterosexual students claiming that LGBTQIA+ individuals do not have the right to exist, using their religion to justify this claim
- a faculty member expecting a Latinx student in the classroom to educate the rest of the class on the topic of Mexican immigration patterns
- male students continuously disrupting the class by directing sexist comments at a female teaching assistant
- a White student threatening an African American student over views on affirmative action

These kinds incidents of cultural and personal misunderstandings – in addition to institutional discrimination, inadequate or no training for faculty on issues of diversity, and a lack of preparation of students for engaging in productive classroom discussions – contribute to a picture of tense college campuses and classrooms waiting to be disrupted as a result of these and other incidents.

That said, there are instances where faculty have used and are using diversity in the classroom as an opportunity or asset to enhance teaching and learning. For example:

- an instructor who organizes a fishbowl discussion of male students to discuss their attitudes toward women after a student makes a controversial remark in class
- a faculty member teaching students about the difference between a debate and a dialogue in order to have productive expressions of free speech and thereby enhancing the learning process
- students receiving and learning about ground rules for classroom discussions related to respect, free speech, and personalizing the issues

In sum, the prospects of diversity involve using the multiple perspectives, cultures, languages, and other characteristics that different social identities bring to the class as assets or tools in

creating greater understanding and knowledge about these issues. This task is not easy and requires special skills and techniques.

This document is intended to be a resource for addressing difficult or challenging topics in the classroom. No faculty is required to utilize the guidelines. It is merely suggestions for faculty who want to engender the broadest possible perspectives, opinions, and experiences and to maximize free speech in the classroom.

Understanding Diversity and Inclusive Excellence

INCLUSIVE EXCELLENCE

Inclusive Excellence requires that we create inclusive learning environments that are attentive to issues of diversity. Issues related to differences manifest themselves across all courses, assignments, curriculums, and pedagogies. Faculty play a major role in creating and promoting an inclusive learning environment. This guide includes suggestions for addressing issues of diversity and inclusiveness in the classroom.

INCLUSIVENESS MATTERS

How, what, and who we teach matters when it comes to diversity and inclusiveness. The books, readings, case studies, word problems and examples presented in the classroom can either include diverse communities by drawing on the history, culture, and experiences of different groups, or they can exclude those same communities by obliterating them from the curriculum. It goes without saying that teaching tools have to be selected carefully to be sensitive and validating to diverse communities as opposed to stereotyping and offending.

SOCIAL IDENTITY

The social identities of each faculty member influences how students perceive and receive them. Research suggests, for example, that women of color and white women receive low teaching evaluations in those courses where diversity is the central topic. International faculty members get complaints from students about their accents. Faculty of color have to work harder than White faculty at establishing credibility in the classroom. The issue is not that there is something inherently wrong with these social identities themselves. Rather, these are symptoms of the various social and power dynamics that play out in the classroom.

UNDERSTANDING YOURSELF

It is important to understand yourself as a faculty member. Getting to know your own biases, hot buttons, pedagogical style, issues about which you are passionate, privileges, likes and dislikes, and other personal characteristics will only help you in dealing with classroom issues.

NO APPREHENSION

Just because there is tremendous diversity in the classroom does not mean you should be apprehensive about it and fear that at any moment you will make a mistake. You are not expected to know the dynamics, history, and experience of every social identity in your class. Simply acknowledge that there is diversity, do your best to address issues that come up, apologize and correct mistakes whenever possible, and proceed to teach. Make an effort to educate yourself.

Preparing Students for Addressing Diversity in the Classroom

Students enter higher education without the tools to engage in classroom discussions or to interact with other students, in particular with students from diverse backgrounds. Below are some examples of tools/exercises that can be utilized to prepare students to engage in classroom dialogues.

Tools/Exercises for Preparing Students To Interact in the Classroom

Four Corners Exercise: Divide students into four groups based on their dialogue engagement style. Corner #1: Students who share a lot in class; Corner #2: Students who only talk when they are particularly motivated by the topic; Corner #3: Students who talk only when called on by the professor; and Corner #4: Students who don't talk at all in class. Have the students discuss different types of communication in their small groups as well as large group processing

Active Listening Exercise: Roleplay with another person (student) the dynamics of bad listening (e.g., interrupting, getting side-tracked, showing signs of inattentiveness) while that student talks about a topic (e.g., describing her high school). Next, roleplay the same scenario but this time practice active listening (e.g., ask questions for clarification, agree, shake your head in agreement). Break the students in dyads and have them practice active listening with each other.

Ice Breakers: Getting students to become familiar with each other can decrease conflict and tension in the classroom. The more students get to know each other, the less likely that they will disrespect each other. The web offers plenty of resources related to ice breakers that can be used in the classroom.

Mixing Students: It is important to constantly mix the students so that they can get to know everyone in class, not just those they are comfortable with. Students, like most, are creatures of habit who tend to sit in the same spot next to the same student week after week. Again, ice breakers are a good way to create greater interaction among students.

Strategies for Engaging Students

Modeling: Modeling is a technique that can be used to establish a climate of non-defensiveness and honesty. For example, a heterosexual facilitator might relate his own growth and development with respect to understanding different sexualities (e.g. going from having bias towards the LGBTQIA+ community to cultivating an understanding and appreciation for members of this group). Another facilitator might relate a story about how she used to fear African Americans, but then actively confronted this bias and learned that her fears had never been warranted. Modeling sets up the conditions for participants to, in an honest way, begin to recognize, acknowledge, and examine their own issues.

Storytelling: During intergroup dialogues, the use of stories is a powerful technique for creating consciousness and awareness. Through storytelling, participants learn to bond and understand each other on a personal/individual level. The objective of storytelling is for students to gain a deeper understanding of the different groups to which their peers belong. Stories are interesting

and convey emotion, history, pain, joy, spirituality, friendship, forgiveness, and other ideas. They are an effective tool in intergroup dialogue for explaining constructs, engaging participants, eliciting emotions, and breaking down barriers between groups.

Metaphors: A metaphor as "a figure of speech in which a word or phrase literally denoting one kind of object or idea is used in place of another to suggest a likeness or analogy between them" (Webster's Dictionary). Like stories, metaphors are also tools that assist students in dialogue, helping them express themselves and their perspectives in interesting and deep ways. For example, participants might be asked to use a metaphor to describe their understanding of race relations in America. Someone might provide the following metaphor: "Race relations in America remind me of the relationship between the earth and the sky. The earth represents ethnic/racial minorities, which sends water (e.g., diverse cultures, perspectives, opinions) to the clouds through the process of evaporation, making the sky look beautiful. For their part, clouds (which remind me of Whites) return the water back to the earth and enrich it. Both the earth and the clouds are equally important and need each other in order to live and make life interesting."

Group work: Small group interaction is a good technique that allows participants to become more acquainted and to share ideas with a few other students. Some students are reluctant to raise issues in large dialogue groups. Small groups are an excellent way to help these students in particular to feel comfortable sharing their thoughts and ideas. Small group work allows for everybody to participate and represents an opportunity for participants to teach each other.

Collages/Art Work: Collages and other forms of art tap into students' creative and visual side. Here students might be asked to create a collage depicting intergroup relations or intergroup concepts and ideas. After completing their project, students might be asked to present and explain their art pieces.

Fish bowl discussions: Fishbowl discussions entail placing all members of one group (e.g., African American students) in a circle in the center of the room surrounded by students without that identity (e.g. students who are not African American). The facilitator leads a discussion with the center group for a specified amount of time (e.g. 20 minutes), while everyone else listens. Then, the groups switch places and those originally in the outer circle are led in their own facilitated discussion while the those originally in the inner circle listen. Finally, both groups come together and as a whole discuss any issues that emerged from the fishbowl discussions. This is a great strategy as it creates a space for greater understanding of other students' perspectives and experiences. For many participants, this is their first opportunity to "listen in" on a discussion involving groups that they normally don't get to hear.

Reflection sessions: Reflection sessions are designed to get individual participants to think at a deeper level about experiences, issues, or concepts. Through questions, exercises, and other techniques, participants critically examine their thoughts, beliefs, assumptions, and the change process on the way to gaining a better understanding of groups, prejudice, discrimination, and oppression. Critical to this process is an examination of the dynamics of taking action toward change.

Journaling: Journaling is one form of reflection that takes the form of writing. Journaling allows students to write about issues confidentially. This confidentiality encourages students to explore issues of diversity in a very honest way.

Personal and Group Affirmation: Creating a safe space for students for engaging in dialogue about challenging topics is vital in promoting positive intergroup interactions. Some ground rules might include:

- *One Diva, One Mic:* Do not interrupt others. Only one speaker should talk at a time
- *Confidentiality:* Encourage students to continue these conversations outside of class with their peers; however, make sure that students do not disclose the names of students who shared in class. In other words, they can share the idea without saying whose idea it was.
- *Oops/ouch:* If a student feels hurt or offended by another student's comment, the hurt student can say "ouch." In acknowledgement, the student who made the hurtful comment says "oops." If necessary, there can be further dialogue about this exchange.

For more ground rules for classroom discussions, see page 7.

Ground rules help students feel comfortable being honest. Students should be affirmed for being open, honest, and vulnerable about their perspectives and experiences. This contributes to promoting mutual respect and trust among group members.

Visual Imagery: Visual imagery involves using various techniques (e.g. media or guided prompting) to encourage students to imagine they are "in someone else's shoes." For example, a facilitator might have students imagine that they are in a foreign country where they do not know anyone personally and where they are unfamiliar with the language or culture. After the students process their experience of this imagined scenario, the facilitator might relate the imagined scenario to an applied cultural situation. For example, students can be prompted to think about the experience of Native American students who attend college off of their reservation and have to adjust to a very different cultural environment.

Guidelines for Classroom Discussions

It is important to establish ground rules for dialogue, interaction, and behavior at the beginning of each course. This is critical because it will validate students from diverse backgrounds, create trust in you as an instructor, and establish a safe space for interaction. Moreover, if conflict emerges, you can always refer the students back to the rules of engagement.

- While setting ground rules, explain that the idea is to create a safe, caring, and respectful atmosphere.
- Explain why conversations about diversity are important. It is all of our responsibilities to be engaged in dialogue about oppression, bias, power, and other topics related to living in a multicultural world. These conversations are a part of a healing process between members of our community. Hopefully, we leave each discussion with deeper understanding and a renewed hope for the future.
- Explain that sharing is voluntary, meaning that students can share their perspectives and experiences to the degree that they are comfortable.
- Explain that sharing should be based on one's own feelings, experiences and perceptions. Students should not be expected to speak on behalf of or represent an entire race, culture, gender, etc. In expressing viewpoints, students should try to raise questions and comments in way that will promote learning, rather than defensiveness and conflict in other students. Thus, questions and comments should be asked or stated in such a way that will promote greater insight into and awareness of topics as opposed to anger and conflict.
- Explain that students' views may vary, and that the most important part of intergroup dialogue is creating a space for the exchange of different feelings, thoughts, and beliefs. While this allows students to express their opinions, they are also accountable for the ideas that they share. Name calling, accusations, verbal attacks, sarcasm, and other negative exchanges are counter-productive to successful teaching and learning about topics.
- Explain that students should avoid quick judgments. Rather than jumping right to criticism, encourage students to practice active listening and to seek to understand another student's perspective.
- Encourage students to avoid getting tied up in debate and argument. It rarely changes anything or anyone and tends to ultimately inhibit open sharing.
- Encourage students to practice active listening and to give full attention to whomever is talking.
- Discourage the devaluation of emotions and feelings. We may laugh and cry together, share pain, joy, fear and anger.
- Explain that in dialogues, every makes mistakes. What is most important is that we use these moments as occasions for learning and forgiving.

Example of Guidelines

1. Dialogue is a two-way process; it involves balancing deep listening and open honest sharing.
2. Everyone is encouraged to speak.
3. Be respectful particularly when speaking to each other.
4. Risk trusting other people with your feelings and experience.
5. Share what feels comfortable for you – don't go beyond that.
6. You do not need a clear position or to be an expert; it is okay to be confused or to change your mind.
7. People who listen more than they speak often have more of value to share.
8. Try to be present for the full process as absence can have a negative impact.
8. If you feel uncomfortable, you may need to take time out, but let the facilitator know.
9. At some point in time, we may need to agree to disagree and move on to another topic.
10. Feel free to ask if you don't understand.
11. Dialogue is not about agreement it is about deepening understanding.
12. Question what you hear and what you think.
13. Keep an open mind.
14. Help and support each other throughout the process.

Dialogue vs. Debate

Dialogue is collaborative: two or more sides work together towards common understanding.

Debate is oppositional: two sides oppose each other and attempt to prove each other wrong.

In **dialogue**, the goal is to find common ground.

In **debate**, the goal is to win.

In **dialogue**, one listens to the other side(s) in order to understand, find meaning and find agreement.

In **debate**, one listens to the other side in order to find flaws and to counter its arguments.

Dialogue enlarges and possibly changes participants' points of view.

Debate affirms each participant's own point of view.

Dialogue reveals assumptions for re-evaluation.

Debate defends assumptions as truth.

Dialogue promotes introspection in considering one's positions.

Debate promotes critique of the another person's positions.

Dialogue opens the possibility of reaching a better solution than any original solutions.

Debate defends one's own positions as *the* best solution and excludes other options.

Dialogue promotes an open-minded attitude – an openness to being wrong and an openness to change.

Debate promotes a close-minded attitude – a determination to be right.

In **dialogue**, a person contributes their thoughts knowing that other people's reflections will help improve those thoughts rather than destroy them.

In **debate**, a person contributes their thoughts and defends them against any challenges to prove that they are right.

Dialogue calls a temporary suspension of one's beliefs.

Debate calls for investing wholeheartedly in one's beliefs.

In **dialogue**, one searches for fundamental agreements.

In **debate**, one searches for glaring differences.

In **dialogue** one searches for strengths in another person's positions.

In **debate** one searches for flaws and weaknesses in another person's positions.

Dialogue involves a real concern for the other person and seeks to not alienate or offend.

Debate involves countering other positions without considering another person's feelings and how the interaction belittles or deprecates the other person.

Dialogue assumes that many people have pieces of the answer and that they can put them into a workable solution together.

Debate assumes that there is a right answer and that someone has it.

Dialogue remains open-ended.

Debate implies a conclusion.

Adapted from a paper prepared by Shelley Berman, which was based on discussions of the Dialogue Group of the Boston Chapter of Educators for Social Responsibility (ESR).

<http://en.copian.ca/library/learning/study/scdvd.htm>

Microaggressions in the Classroom

Microaggressions are “the everyday verbal, nonverbal, and environmental slights, snubs or insults, whether intentional or unintentional, that communicate hostile, derogatory, or negative messages to target persons based solely upon their marginalized group membership” (Sue et al., 2007). Microaggressions are a challenge on our college campuses, in particular in college classrooms. Students might experience microaggressions based on race, ethnicity, religion, nationality, sexual orientation, gender expression, gender identity, disability, age, socio-economic status, and other diverse dimensions. Microaggressions from faculty towards students may manifest as inappropriate jokes, malicious comments, singling-out students, setting exams and project due dates on religious holidays, and stereotyping. Microaggressions are often unintentional and unconsciously committed by faculty. Stated differently, microaggressions are not being committed by spiteful and bigoted professors who want to intentionally hurt students from diverse groups, but rather are undertaken at the unconscious level by well-meaning and caring professors. Nevertheless, the effects on students who are the recipients of microaggressions include anger, frustration, and withdrawal. The bottom line is that microaggressions can create hostile and unwelcoming classroom environments.

The purpose of this discussion is to create awareness of microaggressions in the classroom committed by faculty towards students. It is important to note here that students also commit microaggressions against other students, and faculty must also be vigilant about those incidents. Both students and faculty play a role in and are responsible for creating safe and inclusive classroom environments. The following two sections contain information about definitions pertaining to microaggressions as well as specific examples of microaggressions. It is important to recognize that microaggressions are not germane to social science classes, but occur in courses representing different disciplines (e.g., math, physics, biology). The concluding section offers specific suggestions for faculty on how to recognize and combat microaggressions in hopes of working towards building inclusive classrooms.

Definitions of Microaggressions

- **Microaggressions:** The everyday verbal, nonverbal, and environmental slights, snubs or insults, whether intentional or unintentional, that communicate hostile, derogatory, or negative messages to target persons based solely upon their marginalized group membership (Sue et al., 2007)
- **Microinsults:** Behaviors, actions, or verbal remarks that convey rudeness, insensitivity, or demean a person’s group or social identity or heritage (Sue, et. al. 2007)
- **Microinvalidations:** Actions that exclude, negate, or nullify the psychological thoughts, feelings or experiential reality of people who represent different groups (Sue, et. al. 2007)

Examples of Microaggressions

- Continuing to mispronounce the names of students after they have corrected you time and time again
Professor: "Is Jose Cuinantila here?"
Student: "I am here, but my name is Jesús Quintanilla."
- Scheduling tests and project due dates on religious or cultural holidays
"It has just been pointed out to me that I scheduled the mid-term during Rosh Hashanah, but we are okay because I don't see any Jewish students in the class."
- Setting low expectations for students from particular groups or high schools
"Oh, so Robert, you're from Pine Ridge High School? You are going to need lots of academic help in my class!"
- Calling on and validating male students and ignoring female students during class discussions
"Let's call on John again. He seems to have lots of great responses to some of these problems."
- Using inappropriate humor in class that degrades students from different groups, including mocking different accents
"I have a joke for you: There was a Jew, a Mexican, and a Black. The Mexican says to the..."
- Expressing racially charged political opinions in class assuming that people with those racial/ethnic identities do not exist in class
"I think illegal aliens are criminals because they are breaking the law and need to be rounded up and sent back to Mexico."
- Singling students out in class because of their backgrounds
"You're Asian! Can you tell us what the Japanese think about our trade policies?"
- Hosting debates in class that place students from groups who may represent the minority opinion in class in a difficult position.
"Today we are going to have a debate on immigration. I expect the three Latino students and plus two others to argue in favor of immigration. The rest of you will provide arguments against immigration."
- Denying the experiences of students by questioning the credibility and validity of their stories
"I've eaten and shopped plenty of times in that part of town and it's nothing like you describe it. How long have you lived there and who are you hanging out with?"
- Assigning class projects that are heterosexist, sexist, racist, or promote other oppressions

“For the class project, I want you to think about a romantic relationship that you have had with a member of the opposite sex. Think and write about your observations.”

- Not respecting students gender pronouns, especially students who use gender neutral pronouns
“Alex, you use ‘they/them’ pronouns. No, that’s too confusing. They is plural. I’m going to use him for you.”
- Using heterosexist or sexist examples or language in class.
“Atoms sometimes attract each other like this male and female here. At the same time, atoms sometimes repel each other like these two males here.”
- Assigning projects that ignore differences in socioeconomic class status
“For this class, you are required to visit four art galleries located in the downtown area. The entrance fees vary, but I am sure you can afford it.”
- Assuming that all students are from the U.S and fully understand American culture and the English language (i.e., be aware that there may be international students in the class)
“What do you mean you have never heard of The Cosby Show? Where have you been hiding?”
- Discouraging students from working on projects that explore their own social identities
“If you are Native American, I don’t want you to write your paper on Native Americans. You already know everything about that group and besides you will be biased in your writing.”
- Asking people with invisible disabilities to identify themselves in class
“This is the last time that I am going to ask. Anybody with a disability who needs extra help, raise your hand!”
- Ignoring student-to-student microaggressions, even when the interaction is not course-related.
Student: “Don’t be retarded! That party this weekend was so gay.”
Professor: says nothing
- Making assumptions about students and their backgrounds:
 - Latinx/Chicanx students
“You’re Latino, and you don’t speak Spanish? You should be ashamed of yourself!”
 - Asian/Asian American students
“I know who I’m calling on a lot to work some of the math problems in this class – Mr. Nguyen!”
 - African America/Black students

“Mr. Summers! We just read about poverty among Blacks in America. Does this fit your experience and can you tell us about it?”

- Native American students
“Many Native American tribes are in favor of using casinos to increase revenues and many others are against it. Mr. Begay, as a Navajo what are your thoughts?”
- Jewish or Muslim students
“Oh, your Muslim! Can you tell us about what the Palestinians think about Jewish settlements in the West Bank?”
- Non-Traditional Students
“All you millennials are on Facebook, so I will post the evite for the class project on the site.”

Suggestions for Interrupting Microaggressions

Be cognizant that microaggressions are also directed by students against other students. Be prepared to interrupt those incidents, too. Even if you are not sure how to address the climate issue in the moment, it is appropriate classroom management to stop problematic behavior immediately. You can follow up with individual students or the entire class later, after reflecting and/or consulting with colleagues on how best to do so.

Here are some tips for disrupting microaggressions in the classroom:

Example Microaggression

A student says to an Asian person: “You’re all good in math. Can you help me with this problem?”

Example Intervention

“I heard you say that all Asians are good in math. What makes you believe that?” *Inquire:* Ask the speaker to elaborate. This will give you more information about where they are coming from and may also help the speaker to become aware of what they are saying.

Example Microaggression

You notice that your female student is being frequently interrupted during a class discussion.

Example Intervention

“I think Emily brings up a good point. I didn’t get a chance to hear it all. Can Emily repeat it?”
Reframe: Create a different way to look at the situation.

Example Microaggression

In a discussion related to race, a White student turns to a Black student and says: “When I look at you, I don’t see color.”

Example Intervention

“So you don’t see color. Tell me more about your perspective. I’d also like to invite others to weigh in.” *Re-direct:* Shift the focus to a different person (particularly helpful when someone is being asked to speak for their entire race, cultural group, etc.)

Example Microaggression

Someone makes a joke that is racist, sexist, homophobic, etc.

Example Intervention

“I didn’t think this was funny. I’d like you to stop.”

References:

UCLA Diversity & Faculty Development. “Tool: Recognizing Microaggressions and the Messages They Send” in *Diversity in the Classroom*.

academicaffairs.ucsc.edu/events/documents/Microaggressions_Examples_Arial_2014_11_12.pdf

Other Suggestions to Faculty for Addressing Microaggressions in the Classroom

- Work to create a safe environment for all identities in the classroom by establishing ground rules and expectations regarding discussions about and presentations on issues of diversity.
- Debates are one technique that instructors often use in class to explore and get students engaged in issues. However, it is important to distinguish between debates and dialogues. Debates are about people discussing issues and competing to see who has the “best” response. They have the explicit assumption that someone will win and someone will lose. Dialogues, on the other hand, are about achieving greater levels of understanding by listening to each other as we delve deeper into issues. In the end, whichever technique you use, make sure that you establish ground rules and set the context for the activity.
- If you are going to express your political opinions in the classroom, understand that there is a risk of silencing students who do not agree with your views. As a faculty member, when you express your views to students you are doing so out of a position of power. That is, students may be afraid to express themselves given that they know your position on an issue and that their grade may be on the line. Similarly, be aware of how balanced you are in challenging student opinions that do or do not agree with your own.
- If you are going to bring in guest speakers, make sure that your objectives are clear in bringing those individuals to class—clear to you, to the class, and to the guest. If the reason is to introduce a particular perspective, try to balance the discussion by inviting different guest speakers or assigning readings with other perspectives.
- It is okay to use humor in class. However, make sure that it is appropriate humor that does not target or degrade any student in the class or group of people overall. Classrooms are for engaging issues and learning concepts and new ideas. Classrooms are not for having students, faculty, or guests mock or denigrate people.
- In those cases where students do have the courage to contact you and point out that they were offended by a remark that you made or an action that you undertook, listen to them. As previously indicated, given that you are in a position of power, it probably took a lot of courage for them to raise the issue with you.

- Know that there are resources at on campus to support you in addressing microaggressions in the classroom, such as the Office for Diversity and Inclusive Excellence.

References:

Sue, D. W.; Bucceri, J.; Lin, A. I; Nadal, K. L.; and Torino, G. C. (2007). Racial microaggressions and the Asian American Experience. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*. Vol. 13. No. 1. pp. 72-81.

Solorzano, D., Ceja, M., & Yosso, T. (2000). Critical race theory, racial microaggressions, and campus racial climate: The experiences of African American college students. *The Journal of Negro Education*, 69, 60-73.

Validating Students of Color

Research in higher education demonstrates that students of color often have to contend with campus climates that are less than welcoming, familiar, or hospitable. Acts of insensitivity, misperceptions, miscommunications, stereotypes, and hostile or degrading acts are part of such climates that send invalidating messages to students of color (Hurtado, Milem, Clayton-Pedersen, & Allen, 1998). In addition, there is often a mismatch between the culture and background of students of color and that of predominantly White institutions (Yosso, 2005).

These environments impact students' decisions about staying or leaving college, in turn affecting rates of retention. Many colleges and universities have developed services and initiatives that attempt to support and affirm students as they negotiate the environments described above. Cultural centers, diversity offices, affinity group academic advisors, cultural programming, and mentors are but a few of the support structures in place to assist students of color as they pursue their education.

Factors that impact the success of students of color are numerous and complex. One of those factors is validation. Validation refers to the active affirmation of students for their skills, talents, culture, presence, and contributions to a college or university by faculty, staff, and students. The theory of validation was first proposed in 1994 by Dr. Laura Rendon, Professor of Higher Education at the University of Texas at San Antonio and is based on research that suggests that students of color feel reassured and validated when faculty and staff are caring, show concern, acts as mentors, advocate for them, and acknowledge their cultural backgrounds (Rendon, 1994). Validating experiences include faculty and staff doing the following:

- Encouraging students to keep trying and succeeding
- Recognizing students for their academic success
- Taking time to learn students' names and pronounce them correctly
- Making sure that the students' cultural backgrounds are included in the curriculum
- Reaching out to offer assistance to students

Dimensions of Validation

Validation as a theory has several dimensions that address both the academic and interpersonal aspects of being a student (Rendon & Linares, 2011). First, it places the responsibility for validation on faculty and staff. Coaches, instructors, counselors, financial aid advisors, student affairs professionals, library staff, and administrators all have a role to play in validating students of color. Second, it is important to raise students' academic self-esteem and recognize their capacity to succeed. Third, students who are validated tend to increase their involvement in college, a known factor that leads to persistence and success (Astin, 1984). Fourth, the acknowledgement that students can get validation in and out of the classroom is essential. Here the role of leadership opportunities, student organizations, community service, and other out-of-class activities play a central role. Fifth, validation is a process that spans the four to five years that students are in college. Thus, whether the student is new or getting ready to graduate, the process of validation is important to students. Finally, and closely related to the fifth dimension, is the recognition that validation is extremely important to non-traditional students, especially during the first days and weeks of college.

What Can Faculty, Staff, and Administrators Do to Practice Validation?

UA faculty, staff, and administrators can validate students of color in many ways. Below are examples of how to affirm students with the overall objective of promoting their success at UA:

- When addressing groups of students of color, recognize their academic success, their presence on campus, and their contributions to the UA community.
- Hold students of color to the same standards and expectations as white students. At the same time, recognize that some marginalized students need additional resources and support to be successful. Refer students to resources on campus that can support their success on campus or address their issues.
- Insert diversity into your curriculum to ensure that students of color see themselves in the assignments, materials, books, and examples.
- Avoid the language of “deficit thinking” (e.g. minority, disadvantaged, lack of cultural capital, culturally-deprived, at risk etc.) when talking about students of color. Use “asset-based” language such as talented, gifted, culturally-rich, and scholars of color.
- Highlight the accomplishments of students of color. Identify a talent or skill in a student and acknowledge those gifts. For example, be sure to provide positive feedback on academic work. Encourage students of color to continue using their talents by pursuing graduate degrees.
- Mentor and guide students of color. Some students of color are first-generation college students. Recognize that these students might not know how to navigate the terrains of higher education. Provide these students with resources and guidance as requested. In class, when reviewing your syllabus with everyone, explain terms like “office hours” and avoid using acronyms.
- Educate yourself about different groups and their cultures, especially as they relate to your students. At the same time, do not make assumptions about your students’ cultural backgrounds and experiences.
- Be an advocate for a student of color.
- Be aware of scholarships, internships, or conferences geared towards students of color so that you can share these opportunities with them.
- Attend events organized and sponsored by ethnic/racial student organizations and encourage all of your students to also attend. Accept invitations to speak at events sponsored by ethnic/racial student organizations.
- Write letters of recommendation for students of color who are applying for scholarships, pursuing graduate education, or seeking a job.

Validation can be a powerful concept for addressing issues of persistence and success for students of color. It is most effective when provided by faculty or staff whom the students trust and are sincere in providing the affirmation. Validation is good for all students and should be practiced widely, especially with students of other diverse backgrounds (i.e. women, LGBTQIA+ students, veterans, students with disabilities, etc.).

References:

Asint, A. W. (1984). Student Involvement: A developmental theory for higher education. *Journal of College Student Personnel*, 25(4), 297-308.

Hurtado, S., Milem, J. F., Clayton-Pedersen, A. R., and Allen, W. R. (1998) Enhancing Campus Climates for Racial/Ethnic Diversity: Educational Policy and Practice *The Review of Higher Education* 21.3 279-302.

Rendon, L. I., (1994). Validating culturally diverse students: Toward a new model of learning and student development. *Innovative Higher Education*. (19)1, 33-51.

Rendon, L. I., and Linares, S. M., (2011). Revisiting Validation Theory: Theoretical foundations, applications, and extensions. *Enrollment Management Journal*. 12-33.

Yosso, T. J. (2005). Whose culture has capital? A critical race theory discussion of community cultural wealth. *Race, Ethnicity, and Education*. 8(1), 60-91.

CS 239.1: Social and Professional Issues

Department of Computer Science
College of Sciences and Humanities, Ball State University

COURSE SYLLABUS

Instructor:	David L. Largent	Preferred pronouns:	Semester:	Spring 2021
Office:	RB 375	he, him, his	Class meeting days:	Monday
Phone:	765-285-8641		Class meeting time:	4:00-4:50 PM
E-Mail:	dllargent@bsu.edu		Class location:	BB 109
LinkedIn:	www.linkedin.com/in/davidlargent			
Website:	www.cs.bsu.edu/homepages/dllargent			
Twitter:	twitter.com/ProfLargent			
Office Hours: (virtual)	Posted in Canvas (or by appointment, or take your chance and drop by) Virtual office: bsu.zoom.us/my/DaveLargent			

Important Dates:	Last day to add/drop courses	Monday, January 25, 2021
	Study Day	Wednesday, February 24, 2021
	Last day to withdraw from courses	Monday, March 22, 2021
	Study Day	Tuesday, March 23, 2021
	Study Day	Wednesday, April 14, 2021
	Final examination	Monday, May 3, 2021, 4:00-4:50 PM

Note: Should a regular class day need to be canceled during the semester, the Final Examination will be rescheduled for Thursday, May 6, 2021, from 7:00-7:50 PM.

Contents

I. Welcome!.....	2	IX. Course Policies: Student and instructor expectations.....	7
II. University Course Catalog Data	2	X. Course Format	9
III. The course's big ideas.....	2	XI. Course schedule.....	10
IV. Support for being a student	4	XII. Required Texts and Materials.....	10
V. Support for being a human	5	XIII. Classroom Response System	10
VI. COVID-19 policies and expectations.....	6	XIV. Student Effort and Basis for Final Grade	12
VII. Course Policies: Grades.....	6	XV. Research possibility.....	15
VIII. Course Policies: Technology	6	XVI. Subject to change.....	16

- Use of a Web browser to open Web pages, open PDF files, and manage a list of Web pages (bookmarks/favorites).
- Download and install programs from the Internet.

If you have technology issues with your computer, Canvas, BSU email, or related technology, contact the BSU [Technology Helpdesk support site](#). If you are not able to resolve your issue there, I will be glad to do what I can to help.

E-mail: You must send e-mail to me from your BSU account, or through Canvas; this is the only way for me to verify your identity. I may ignore e-mail sent from other accounts. Monitor your BSU Canvas and e-mail accounts on a regular basis, *at least daily*. Your lack of seeing an announcement or e-mail does not constitute an excuse for making up, or turning in, late work. You can expect an e-mail response from me within 12 to 18 hours, usually much quicker. However, I only commit to monitor my BSU e-mail account actively Monday through Friday from 8:00 AM to 5:00 PM. Although you may find that I read and reply to e-mail at many other times, do not *depend* on me doing so.

Canvas notifications: I expect that you have set your Canvas notifications such that you will receive notification when any of the following occur:

- I send you a Canvas message
- I post a Canvas announcement
- I post a comment on an assignment submission.

Computer access and privileges: You may use computers, tablets, and electronic devices to help you participate in class activities but silence all devices and use them respectfully around others as their use can be disruptive to those around you. If a device disrupts the class, I may ban its use. Do not abuse your computer privileges; that is, make sure to stay mentally present and attentive in class by only using your computer in ways pertinent to class and related activities. If I see you repeatedly violating this privilege, I may ask you to leave class, and you will be marked absent for the day.

IX. Course Policies: Student and instructor expectations

General expectations: The following lists provide general expectations I have of you, and which you can have of me. These items are discussed in more detail elsewhere in this syllabus.

I expect you to...

- be present, punctual, prepared, and attentive during each class session
- be willing to participate positively and constructively in class
- listen to and respect others
- complete all assignments in a timely manner
- turn off or ignore your cell phone during class sessions
- discuss course concerns with me either after class or during a meeting with me
- assume ownership of one's ideas, opinions, values, etc.
- understand and abide by the procedures, regulations, and schedules described in this syllabus

You can expect me to...

- be present, punctual, prepared, and enthusiastic during each class session
- be genuinely concerned about my students' ability to perform well
- provide a class structure to encourage student learning
- be a co-learner in the education process
- listen to and respect students' views
- grade objectively, consistently, and timely
- turn off or ignore my cell phone during class sessions
- respond swiftly and effectively to student concerns
- remain faithful to the procedures, regulations, and schedules described in this syllabus

Attendance policy: Regular and consistent attendance is necessary for you to do well in this course because absence results in the loss of classroom interaction for you, your peers, and me. Much of what you will learn will come from experiences we have in class and the learning will require your participation. My experience shows that students do better in this course if they attend class regularly, even if they think they already know the material. Ball State University expects students to attend and participate in the courses for which they are registered. Attendance will be taken during each class session. As defined in the final course grade table provided in the "Student effort and basis for final grade" section of this document, you may miss a limited number of days without affecting your grade.

I understand that extenuating circumstances may arise that can make participation difficult, but please let me know via e-mail beforehand if you cannot attend class, take an exam, or turn in an assignment on time. If circumstances cause you to miss more than the equivalent of two weeks of class sessions during the semester, you may have overextended yourself and should consider withdrawing from this course, but please have a conversation with me before you do.

Because random arrivals and departures are disrespectful and distracting, please plan to arrive to class on time and to stay for the entire class session. If circumstances dictate that you must be late or you know that you will need to leave early, please take a seat close to the door, so you do not distract others during class time. Arriving late or leaving prior to the end of the class may result in your having an absence recorded for that class session.

You are responsible for your learning regardless of attendance. If you miss a class session, you should consult with trusted classmates to ensure you have the appropriate notes.

However, this semester is unique in that we want students (and everyone) to be aware of their health and not come to class if they are ill. **Please do not come to class if you have COVID-19 symptoms.** If you are sick, or are engaging in self-quarantine, you should contact me and participate in course activities remotely if you are able to do so. You should assume that all due dates and course requirements still apply.

ENG 205, Section 1: World Literature

Welcome to World Literature and the Environment!

I am your professor, Dr. Sreyoshi Sarkar. I designed this course to provide you with an inclusive and collaborative learning experience.

I believe that while I might be the field expert, **each one of you** brings a wealth of living and learning experiences that can enrich this course manifold. Therefore, I ask that you participate in all class activities and assignments, whether on Canvas, Zoom, or in the classroom as fully and wholly as you can. Share your thoughts and notes fearlessly even as you practice civil discourse. Listen to others patiently. Ask questions as and when they occur. Don't hold back. I want this class to be your space to explore, to enjoy, and to evolve with the texts, authors, and your classmates.

In this syllabus, you will find important information about this course. This information will help you to get started and will guide you throughout the semester. Please read this syllabus very carefully and feel free to reach out to me with questions.

A special note as we support each other through the pandemic: Please take care of your mental and physical health first. You must wear a mask and maintain 6 ft. distance from others in the classroom, corridors, and in public places as part of the pandemic's safety protocol and the Cardinal Care Pledge. I have listed some COVID and other wellness resources available on our campus. Please reach out to me if you need more information on any of them.

On my part, I understand that many of us are facing multiple challenges during these trying times, including myself. But I am also hopeful that we will **together** make this class a success by being patient, kind, and communicating clearly and often with each other.

So here's to health, meaningful learning, and all kinds of success you're hoping for this semester!

Best regards,

Dr. Sarkar

Why IT Matters to Higher Education

EDUCAUSE
REVIEW

Toward Inclusive Learning Spaces: Physiological, Cognitive, and Cultural Inclusion and the Learning Space Rating System

Richard Holeton Friday, February 28, 2020

Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI)

16 min read

Inclusive learning space design should be based on a tripartite framework addressing the diverse physiological, cognitive, and cultural needs of learners.



Credit: bsd © 2020

Clearly, learning environments should aim to engage learners, make participants feel welcome, and give everyone an equal opportunity to participate—that is, they should be *inclusive*. The pedagogical design is paramount in this effort, and well-articulated sets of principles such as **the Universal Design for Learning (UDL) Guidelines** [↗] have been developed to inform inclusive teaching practices in the classroom. Likewise, instructional designers have made good progress in

understanding how to promote diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) in online learning environments. But how can we apply such insights to designing *physical* learning spaces? Can we complement inclusive teaching practices, and even facilitate inclusion directly, by how we design and provision classrooms and other learning spaces?

In the Learning Space Rating System (LSRS) version 3.0, planned for release in spring 2020, my colleagues and I attempt a preliminary answer.¹ When our previous team tried to integrate inclusion as a principle in **LSRS 2.0**, we wrestled with a dilemma. As learning space designers, we instinctively knew something about the kinds of things we should *not* do in order to create welcoming spaces. We knew, for example, that if we wanted to engage linguistically diverse students, we should not post important classroom instructions only in English or that if we wanted to make students from historically underrepresented groups feel welcome, we should not line classrooms with pictures of "dead white males." In other words, we knew more about how to create *uninclusive* environments than inclusive environments, and more importantly, we lacked a research-based framework for creating guidelines.

Nevertheless, in our first attempt, we asserted two principles (or "credits," in the parlance of the LSRS) as part of the "Environmental Quality" section of LSRS 2.0:

Environmental and Cultural Inclusiveness (Credit 4.7) and *Accessibility and Universal Design* (Credit 4.8). The former credit was intended to "create an aesthetically pleasing, stimulating and culturally inclusive atmosphere that helps promote engagement in learning activities," and the latter credit aimed to "create an inclusive, safe, and accessible environment for diverse and differently abled participants." These are laudable goals of course, but in hindsight—and with the helpful feedback of reviewers—we found them to be too broad and encompassing and our criteria for achieving them to be vague at best. As Maggie Beers and Teggin Summers noted regarding the breadth of Credit 4.7: "These conditions merit their own subcategories on the LSRS, since they contribute to a student's sense of belonging and success."²

To highlight the importance of these issues in LSRS 3.0, the current team determined to create a completely new section dedicated to "Inclusion and Accessibility," with multiple, fleshed-out credits based on educational research. While the final wording of that section is still under review, the new criteria have been developed from a tripartite framework of physiological, cognitive, and cultural inclusion.³

The LSRS provides institutions with metrics for the design of individual classrooms—or by extension, for a fleet or inventory of classrooms (though not, for now,

informal learning spaces)—measuring the extent to which they can flexibly facilitate multiple modalities of learning and teaching. That goal is fully congruent with the goals of DEI. Yet the distribution and the proportion of successful, well-designed (or "high scoring") classrooms within an institution are not specifically addressed by the LSRS. Issues of what might be called "institutional inequality" are matters of resource allocation and policy. The persuasive case made by Beers and Summers for distributing scarce resources to create larger inventories of basic "learning-ready classrooms," as opposed to a few higher-end or high-tech spaces, speaks to this important aspect of institutional equity.⁴

Physiological Inclusion


The infrastructural attributes of a learning space—such as lighting, acoustics, temperature, and air quality—can make a space feel more or less comfortable and welcoming for people in general and, thus, more or less compatible and motivating for learning. Learning environment researchers have frequently extended the analogy of Maslow's famous hierarchy of needs in this regard.⁵ People cannot learn effectively if they're too hungry, thirsty, hot/cold, or tired, so the learning environment should first ensure that learners' physiological needs for food, water, comfort, and rest

are met. These needs can be addressed in learning environments by, for example, including cafés or vending machines and quiet, contemplative spaces. People also cannot learn effectively if they feel in danger, threatened, or insecure, so learning spaces must ensure physical safety and security for learners. Once these basic needs are addressed—those at the base of Maslow's pyramid—designers can work their way up the pyramid to facilitate the higher-order psychological, cognitive, and meta-cognitive—or "self-actualization" (in Maslow's terms)—needs of learners.

Even the basic physiological factors with the most impact on learning, —temperature, indoor air quality, lighting, and acoustics—may entail more diversity than previously thought. For example, while Glen Earthman determined that the optimal temperature range for learning is between 68 and 74 degrees Fahrenheit (20 to 23.3 degrees Celsius),⁶ early studies either ignored gender or focused on male students. Meanwhile, a growing number of recent studies have found significant differences in thermal comfort levels between the genders. According to Sami Karjalainen's meta-analysis, "Females are more sensitive than males to a deviation from an optimal temperature and express more dissatisfaction, especially in cooler conditions."⁷

Beyond physiological comfort, learning spaces must accommodate a variety of physical attributes and

abilities by following legal requirements such as the ADA (Americans with Disabilities Act) and by providing furnishings and equipment that fit various body sizes and types. Physical impairments (defined as those constraining participation in life activities) that must be accommodated under the ADA include those that impact vision, mobility, communication, and reading.

However, making spaces *accessible* for people with different needs is not the same as making spaces *inclusive*. The **principles of universal design**  established by the Center for Universal Design at North Carolina State University, in partnership with the US Department of Education's National Institute on Disability and Rehabilitation Research, are intended to help make "products, buildings, or environments usable by all people, to the greatest extent possible, without the need for adaptation or specialized design." Offering a solid framework for inclusive design that is readily applied to physical spaces, the seven principles are *Equitable Use*, *Flexibility in Use*, *Simple and Intuitive Use*, *Perceptible Information*, *Tolerance for Error*, *Low Physical Effort*, and *Size and Space for Approach and Use*.⁸ The following is a set of applications to physical space design:

1. *Equitable Use*: Provide identical, or at least equivalent, means for all participants to use the space; avoid segregating or stigmatizing any

participants. In larger spaces, follow the mantra "No Bad Seats"—that is, ensure that all learners can access seating centrally located or close to instructional activities, if they wish. Wheelchair-accessible seating should not be relegated to the edges or margins. As Beers and Summers point out, ADA-compliant furniture that "is fully integrated into the classroom, rather than set apart at the side of the room or marked with a different color laminate or upholstery, helps meet students' social needs, since it is inclusive for students with disabilities."⁹

2. *Flexibility in Use:* Accommodate a wide range of physical abilities, and make accommodations such as support for left-handedness and for ergonomic input devices integral, not marginal, to the classroom design. A fixed-seat classroom outfitted with only right-handed tablet-arm chairs communicates that left-handed people are not welcome or included. But even when, say, 10 percent of the tablet-arm chairs are left-handed, they may be lined up along an outer edge so as not to "intrude" on the space of the right-handed tablets along each row. This solution might proportionally accommodate left-handed people, but by denying them seats in the center of the classroom—by, literally, marginalizing them—it does not allow them to participate on an equal basis with right-handed people.

3. *Simple and Intuitive Use:* Make the classroom and its affordances easy to use for those with a variety of backgrounds, language and literacy skills, and technical fluency. Examples include effective wayfinding and multilingual instructions for use of technology tools.
4. *Perceptible Information:* Provide compatibility with a range of methods and devices used by those with sensory limitations.
5. *Tolerance for Error:* Minimize hazards to avoid accidents or unintended actions. This speaks to the safety factor at the base of Maslow's hierarchy.
6. *Low Physical Effort:* Design spaces and seating to allow for comfort, to maintain neutral body position, and to avoid necessitating repetitive actions or sustained physical effort by participants in learning activities.
7. *Size and Space for Approach and Use:* Accommodate diverse physical attributes by providing furnishings and equipment that fit various body sizes and shapes and by allowing appropriate space to permit the use of assistive devices and to accommodate reach and manipulation regardless of body size, posture, mobility, or hand and grip size.

Cognitive Inclusion

Universal Design for Learning (UDL) applies universal design principles specifically to learning environments. UDL is based on "findings from cognitive neuroscience that tell us about the needs of individual learners" who differ in how they perceive and comprehend information, how they navigate a learning environment to express knowledge, and how they are engaged or motivated to learn.¹⁰ In short, learners are highly variable in their response to instruction. We can call the range of these differences *cognitive diversity* and embrace also in that term *neurodiversity*, which has been somewhat more narrowly associated with normalizing or depathologizing conditions such as autism and ADHD.

In addition to physical accommodations, the ADA requires accommodation for what it terms mental or psychological disabilities, including cognitive impairments (what many now call neurodiversity) arising from conditions such as autism and learning disabilities. Students with learning disabilities may have specific limitations in auditory perception and processing, visual perception and processing, information processing speed, abstract reasoning, long-term or short-term memory, spoken and written language ability, mathematical calculation, or executive functioning (e.g., planning and time management).

Those with autism spectrum disorder (ASD) may suffer from impaired social interaction, diminished communication abilities, and sensory processing problems that may lead to agoraphobia or difficulty moving through spaces. Applying universal design and UDL principles, designers can and should go beyond the legal requirements to design truly inclusive spaces. Learning space design features that can help those with ASD include providing ordered and comprehensible spatial structures, a mix of large and small spaces, and some user control of environmental conditions, such as the amount of stimulation from light and bold colors.

The three main principles of UDL—to provide learners with *multiple means of representation*, *multiple means of expression*, and *multiple means of engagement*—address cognitive diversity primarily through pedagogical design. Instructors applying UDL may provide course materials in multiple media, offer students different options for demonstrating their understanding and mastery, and build various ways for students to engage with instructors and one another. Surely, whether in physical classrooms, online, or hybrid environments, course design and delivery is the most important factor in promoting cognitive inclusion. But as with active learning practices, physical space design can significantly contribute to (or detract from) the ability and ease with which instructors can implement such pedagogies. Each UDL principle is an opportunity to

design and provision classrooms and other learning spaces to facilitate cognitively inclusive practices:

1. *Multiple means of representation:* provide alternatives and multiple media for presenting visual or auditory information, including sound amplification, visual displays, and equipment for lecture and notes capture; provide hardware and software allowing information sharing using multiple media.
2. *Multiple means of expression:* provide access to assistive technologies; provide abundant writable surfaces and computer displays; provide spaces with access to different types of tools for content creation and content sharing.
3. *Multiple means of engagement:* provide diverse and flexible spaces for individual learning, collaboration, and teamwork with movable, reconfigurable furnishings; provide spaces with plenty of room for movement and interaction among peers and between students and instructors.

Many of these physical design features are addressed in various sections of the LSRS instrument, and indeed the entire thrust of UDL around facilitating flexibility and multiple modalities aligns closely with the key principles of the LSRS.

Susan Pliner and Julia Johnson argue that design solutions based on universal principles can benefit not only students with different cognitive or physical capabilities but also students from historically marginalized groups, because "students with disabilities face similar challenges to those faced by students of color" in learning environments. Thus Pliner and Johnson conceive of UDL in a context of multicultural education, power and privilege, and social justice—a framework that leads us to consider the importance of cultural inclusion.¹¹

Cultural Inclusion

If we accept that campus learning environments work best when they provide a sense of security and inclusion along with ways for students to be involved in an experience of community,¹² it follows that we should design spaces with, at a minimum, human-friendly infrastructure and accessibility in mind. But the history of higher education, and of the larger society, makes cultural inclusion—meaning inclusion for people with different backgrounds or social identities—more complex and pressing. Pliner and Johnson note: "Historically, barriers to inclusion in higher education have been based on the explicit exclusion of individuals because of race, gender, national origin, disability, religion, language, and class." As social norms and

demographics have shifted, institutions have, sometimes unknowingly, perpetuated practices that "disproportionately support and reward" the historical white, male, able-bodied, majority.¹³ Stating this more strongly, and in the context of the experiences of indigenous students, Kevin Brown argues: "The constructed university environment overlays the memories of Indigenous people and at times erases, ignores, and subdues Indigenous existence."¹⁴ For example, if we want to achieve a campus ethos of egalitarianism, dignity, and civility, Eamonn Callan of Stanford's Graduate School of Education notes: "Residential halls named to honor people who enslaved some of the residents' recent ancestors are not a terribly good idea."¹⁵

Whereas ideas about neurodiversity and cognitive inclusion arise from cognitive neuroscience, the notion of cultural inclusion is based on social psychology—in particular on people's social identities (e.g., age, gender, race, ethnicity, sexual orientation, social class, religion, nationality) and the concepts of *social belonging* and *social identity threat*. Social belonging (i.e., seeing oneself as socially connected) is a fundamental human motive, so people are especially attuned to environmental cues that might signal social connection or rejection. Uncertainty about social belonging can undermine motivation and achievement for college students from historically excluded ethnic groups. Social

identity threat is experienced by members of a group when that group's perceived competence is devalued or its unique characteristics are insufficiently acknowledged; contextual cues in the environment can communicate low or marginalized status for the group, or even animus toward the group, resulting in poorer academic performance. One form of social identity threat is *stereotype threat*, in which the perception of negative stereotypes about a group have been shown to impair learning, student success, and academic achievement for members of that group.

How do social identity threat and stereotype threat get communicated in learning environments? In addition to structural features, learning spaces have characteristics that are more symbolic, socially constructed, or rhetorical in nature. Today's architects and designers understand that spaces have "character" that is acquired not only through the physical design elements—such as the use of curving surfaces, which are more approachable to humans than sharp-edged ones—but also through a set of often nonconscious "embodied schemas and metaphors" that conjure up mental images and associated emotions. Embodied metaphors, used carefully, can help create emotionally engaging and enriching spaces.¹⁶ In this important sense, architecture is inherently rhetorical—that is, it is a kind of communication or narrative consisting of codes and meanings that promote certain values and beliefs. Thus

the "the symbolic classroom" consists of design features (e.g., classroom layout, wall decor, and display objects) that give visual and rhetorical cues—that tell a story or narrative. Particularly for women, students of color, and members of other historically underrepresented populations, these symbolic elements can strongly influence the character and culture of learning spaces, raise fears about confirmation of group stereotypes, and impact performance, aspirations, engagement, and behavior.¹⁷

Objects and other contextual cues in the environment can signal *who belongs* and can activate biases that make certain groups feel unwelcome. "Even small things carry a powerful message about who is really welcome," says Callan, recounting the experience of a new African American faculty member who encountered a gallery of photographs of white men, his departmental predecessors.¹⁸ Women have been steered away from computer science courses by the presence of stereotypically geeky and masculine objects such as video games and items from the *Star Wars* and *Star Trek* movies. Christmas displays in a campus study space can make Buddhist and Sikh college students, for example, feel less included.¹⁹ More broadly, "socially symbolic objects that embody and communicate group member stereotypes," also known as "ambient identity cues,"²⁰ may be more pervasive and impactful in learning environments than previously thought.

Students' comfort levels and social interactions can be affected even by different classroom layouts. In one study, female college students felt more at ease with seats in cluster arrangements and rows of tablet-arm chairs, while male students were more comfortable with U-shaped seating arrangements and rows of tables with individual chairs.²¹


In their framework for psychologically inclusive learning design, René Kizilcec and Andrew Saltarelli offer a taxonomy of environmental cues that can be manipulated to increase social belonging and/or reduce social identity threat:

1. Verbal content (e.g., written and spoken words)
2. Visual content (e.g., images, animations, photos, videos)
3. Visual design (e.g., color scheme, organization of information)
4. Interaction design (e.g., how users input information, make choices, navigate the environment, and interact socially)²²

Although conceived for the online learning context, these categories can apply both directly and by analogy to physical learning environments, as follows:

- *Verbal and visual content* might include physical signage, room decor, and the display or presentation of course content.
- *Visual design* might include room size and shape, colors, layouts, and lighting.
- *Interaction design* might include how users navigate learning spaces (including by wayfinding) and how they use the affordances of spaces to interact with information, peers, and instructors.

By using language and images friendlier to women to subtly manipulate the verbal and visual cues advertising a computer science course, Kizilcec and Saltarelli measured an increase in female enrollment. Likewise, the University of Washington redesigned a computer lab by repainting walls and hanging nature posters to create a warmer, more appealing environment and to communicate that the subject of computer science and the learning space were welcoming to all. In a classroom virtual reality space, manipulating the symbolic visual elements—to include photographs of female leaders—was associated with the elimination of gender differences in the length and quality of students' speaking performances.²³ Making spaces in and around classrooms more inclusive for gender-nonconforming students, for whom restroom safety can be one of the biggest sources of anxiety, can be as simple as changing

the signage on single, lockable restrooms to be gender neutral or converting male/female restrooms into unisex ones. Research has found that signals of "identity safety" from the creation of gender-inclusive bathrooms can transfer to cis-gender women and members of racial minorities.²⁴ The **Space Reface Toolkit**  from Stanford University's Psychology Department offers a step-by-step guide, and some "quick fixes," to make spaces more inviting for all people. The Toolkit includes a Space Inclusion Quotient Test or "Space IQ Test" to measure belongingness, to "assess a space's people, art, artifacts, amenities, and temperature," and to "improve representations of and accommodations for women and people of color."

Finally, in considering how to create culturally inclusive learning environments, designers must remember that people are not members of just one group but have multiple social identities that intersect in various ways. Proponents of "intersectionality" point out that ethnicity, for example, "may be experienced differently for women as compared to men" and that clearly distinguishing the experiences related to different social identities for one individual may not be possible.²⁵ Likewise, portraying diversity in terms of only one group or subset of groups can backfire by alienating majority groups; subtler cues are more effective and less likely to cause backlash, such as when men reacted negatively to overt "inclusivity cues" targeting women.²⁶ And in making design

interventions, designers should of course take care not to insert token cues or symbols representing groups in stereotypical or disrespectful ways.

Conclusion

Learning spaces should allow everyone to participate on an equal basis and feel welcome and included. An inclusive learning space design practice, therefore, should address the diverse physiological, cognitive, and cultural needs of learners. Based on this framework, the LSRS 3.0 will feature a dedicated section on "Inclusion and Accessibility" suggesting metrics for best practices. Recognizing that these three sets of needs and sources of diversity overlap and intersect in complex ways, I hope the framework presented here, and its expression in the LSRS, will be a springboard for further discussion of inclusive design.

Notes

1. Barbara Brandt et al., *Learning Space Rating System*, version 3 (EDUCAUSE Learning Initiative, 2020 [forthcoming]). ↩
2. Maggie Beers and Teggyn Summers, **"Educational Equity and the Classroom: Designing Learning-Ready Spaces for All"**

Students," *EDUCAUSE Review* 53, no. 3 (May/June 2018). ↩


3. Design teams for educational learning environments should include participants, and in particular students, who represent the physiological, cognitive, and cultural diversity that this framework describes. The perspectives of diverse stakeholders must be integrated throughout the process of designing inclusive learning spaces, including post-occupancy assessment and evaluation. ↩
4. Beers and Summers, **"Educational Equity and the Classroom."** See also Teggins Summers and Maggie Beers, "Ready for Equity? A Cross-Cultural Organizational Framework to Scale Access to Learning-Ready Classrooms That Support Student Success," *Journal of Teaching and Learning with Technology* 8, no. 1 (2019). ↩
5. A. H. Maslow, "A Theory of Human Motivation," *Psychological Review* 50, no. 4 (1943). ↩
6. Glen Earthman, *Prioritization of 31 Criteria for School Building Adequacy* (Baltimore, MD: American Civil Liberties Union Foundation of Maryland, 2004). ↩
7. Sami Karjalainen, "Thermal Comfort and Gender: A Literature Review," *Indoor Air* 22, no. 2 (2012). ↩

8. M. F. Storey, "The Principles of Universal Design," in W.F.E. Preiser and K. H. Smith, eds., *Universal Design Handbook*, 2ded. (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2011). ↩
9. Beers and Summers, "**Educational Equity and the Classroom.**" ↩
10. David Rose et al., "Universal Design for Learning in Postsecondary Education: Reflections on Principles and Their Application," *Journal of Postsecondary Education and Disability* 19, no. 2 (2006). ↩
11. Susan M. Pliner and Julia R. Johnson, "Historical, Theoretical, and Foundational Principles of Universal Instructional Design in Higher Education," *Equity & Excellence in Education* 37, no. 2, (2004). ↩
12. See C. Carney Strange and James H. Nanning, *Educating by Design: Creating Campus Learning Environments That Work* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2001). ↩
13. Pliner and Johnson, "Historical, Theoretical, and Foundational Principles of Universal Instructional Design in Higher Education." ↩
14. Kevin Brown, "Creating Culturally Safe Learning Spaces and Indigenizing Higher Education," *Journal of Learning Spaces* 8, no. (2019): 57. See also K. Lipe, "Toward Equity and Equality:

- Transforming Universities into Indigenous Places of Learning," in Robin Starr Minthorn and Heather J. Shotton, eds., *Reclaiming Indigenous Research in Higher Education* (Newark, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2018). ↩
15. Eamonn Callan, "Education in Safe and Unsafe Spaces," *Philosophical Inquiry in Education* 24, no. 1 (2016). ↩
 16. Sarah Williams Goldhagen, *Welcome to Your World: How the Built Environment Shapes Our Lives* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2017). ↩
 17. Sapna Cheryan, Sianna A. Ziegler, Victoria C. Plaut, and Andrew N. Meltzoff, "**Designing Classrooms to Maximize Student Achievement,**" [↗](#) *Policy Insights from the Behavioral and Brain Sciences* 1, no. 1 (2014). ↩
 18. Callan, "Education in Safe and Unsafe Spaces." ↩
 19. Michael T. Schmitt, Kelly Davies, Mandy Hung, and Stephen C. Wright, "Identity Moderates the Effects of Christmas Displays on Mood, Self-Esteem, and Inclusion," *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology* 46, no. 6 (November 2010). ↩
 20. Sapna Cheryan, Paul G. Davies, Victoria C. Plaut, and Claude M. Steele, "Ambient Belonging: How Stereotypical Cues Impact Gender Participation

- in Computer Science," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 97, no. 6 (2009). ↩
21. Brigitte Burgess and Naz Kaya, "Gender Differences in Student Attitude for Seating Layout in College Classrooms," *College Student Journal* 41, no. 4 (December 2007). ↩
 22. René F. Kizilcec and Andrew J. Saltarelli, "Psychologically Inclusive Design: Cues Impact Women's Participation in STEM Education," in *Proceedings of the CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* (Glasgow, Scotland, May 2019). ↩
 23. Iona M. Latu, Marianne S. Mast, Joris Lammers, and Dario Bombari, "Successful Female Leaders Empower Women's Behavior in Leadership Tasks," *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology* 49, no. 3 (May 2013). ↩
 24. Kimberley E. Chaney and Diana T. Sanchez, "Gender-Inclusive Bathrooms Signal Fairness across Identity Dimensions," *Social Psychological and Personality Science* 9, no. 2 (November 2017). ↩
 25. Kay Deaux, "Social Identity," *Encyclopedia of Women and Gender*, 2 vols. (Cambridge, MA: Academic Press, 2001). ↩
 26. Kizilcec and Saltarelli, "Psychologically Inclusive Design." ↩

Richard Holeton is Assistant Vice Provost for Learning Environments, Emeritus, Stanford University.

© 2020 Richard Holeton. The text of this work is licensed under the **Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License** .

- **Accessibility, Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI), Learning Environments, Learning Space, Technology-enhanced Classrooms**

Provide multiple means of Engagement



Affective Networks
The "WHY" of Learning

Provide multiple means of Representation



Recognition Networks
The "WHAT" of Learning

Provide multiple means of Action & Expression



Strategic Networks
The "HOW" of Learning

Access

Provide options for Recruiting Interest (7)

- Optimize individual choice and autonomy (7.1)
- Optimize relevance, value, and authenticity (7.2)
- Minimize threats and distractions (7.3)

Provide options for Perception (1)

- Offer ways of customizing the display of information (1.1)
- Offer alternatives for auditory information (1.2)
- Offer alternatives for visual information (1.3)

Provide options for Physical Action (4)

- Vary the methods for response and navigation (4.1)
- Optimize access to tools and assistive technologies (4.2)

Build

Provide options for Sustaining Effort & Persistence (8)

- Heighten salience of goals and objectives (8.1)
- Vary demands and resources to optimize challenge (8.2)
- Foster collaboration and community (8.3)
- Increase mastery-oriented feedback (8.4)

Provide options for Language & Symbols (2)

- Clarify vocabulary and symbols (2.1)
- Clarify syntax and structure (2.2)
- Support decoding of text, mathematical notation, and symbols (2.3)
- Promote understanding across languages (2.4)
- Illustrate through multiple media (2.5)

Provide options for Expression & Communication (5)

- Use multiple media for communication (5.1)
- Use multiple tools for construction and composition (5.2)
- Build fluencies with graduated levels of support for practice and performance (5.3)

Internalize

Provide options for Self Regulation (9)

- Promote expectations and beliefs that optimize motivation (9.1)
- Facilitate personal coping skills and strategies (9.2)
- Develop self-assessment and reflection (9.3)

Provide options for Comprehension (3)

- Activate or supply background knowledge (3.1)
- Highlight patterns, critical features, big ideas, and relationships (3.2)
- Guide information processing and visualization (3.3)
- Maximize transfer and generalization (3.4)

Provide options for Executive Functions (6)

- Guide appropriate goal-setting (6.1)
- Support planning and strategy development (6.2)
- Facilitate managing information and resources (6.3)
- Enhance capacity for monitoring progress (6.4)

Goal

Expert learners who are...

Purposeful & Motivated

Resourceful & Knowledgeable

Strategic & Goal-Directed


Teaching into the Abyss: Addressing Students' Camera Usage (or Lack Thereof!) in Zoom

[Home \(https://otl.du.edu/\)](https://otl.du.edu/) | [Online/Hybrid Learning \(https://otl.du.edu/category/onlinehybrid-learning/\)](https://otl.du.edu/category/onlinehybrid-learning/) | [Teaching](#)



Teaching into the Abyss: Addressing Students' Camera Usage (or Lack Thereof!) in Zoom

 [Virginia Pitts \(https://otl.du.edu/author/872842256/\)](https://otl.du.edu/author/872842256/) -  October 23, 2020 -

 [Inclusive Excellence \(https://otl.du.edu/category/inclusive-excellence/\)](https://otl.du.edu/category/inclusive-excellence/) / [Online/Hybrid Learning \(https://otl.du.edu/category/onlinehybrid-learning/\)](https://otl.du.edu/category/onlinehybrid-learning/)

 QUESTIONS? ASK DUBOT

If you've ever had the experience of teaching to a screen full of black boxes in Zoom, you know it can feel like you are teaching into an abyss. It can be hard enough to "read a room" when you are not physically present with your students, and when they have their cameras off during a Zoom session, it's sometimes hard to even know if they are there! Furthermore, if many of your students have their cameras off and their microphones muted, it can be challenging to build that sense of connection and community that is top of mind for so many of us during these times when connection feels more important than ever. And speaking for myself at least, in synchronous situations, even *if* I am the only one speaking it feels like more of an "exchange" when I see others' non-verbal responses or hear their subtle verbal acknowledgements of what I am saying, and it's often through these exchanges that I come into my best teacher-self; when I cannot see or hear the people with whom I am engaging, it's much more difficult – and at times impossible – for me to show up as my full, best self in my teaching.

WHY STUDENTS DON'T USE THEIR CAMERAS

I wish there were a simple, straightforward answer to the question of whether – and how – we can get students to keep their cameras on during Zoom sessions, but the truth of the matter is that it's complex. On the one hand, we know that when students keep their cameras off it can have a detrimental effect on engagement, connection and community in the virtual classroom. Yet, on the other hand, there *are* some legitimate reasons students may choose to have their cameras off; in fact, there are times when having one's camera on, particularly for extended periods of time, can *negatively* impact learning, engagement, and well-being, at least for some students. As Tabitha Moses explains in her blog on "[5 reasons to let students keep their cameras off during Zoom classes \(https://theconversation.com/5-reasons-to-let-students-keep-their-cameras-off-during-zoom-classes-144111\)](https://theconversation.com/5-reasons-to-let-students-keep-their-cameras-off-during-zoom-classes-144111)", students may choose to leave their cameras off because of:

- **Increased anxiety and stress** due to prolonged eye contact, the feeling everyone is watching, and the ways in which large/up-close faces can trigger the body's "flight or fight" response leaving students feeling on edge (this, of course, at a time that is *already* so anxiety and stress-filled for so many of our students!)
- **Zoom fatigue** from, among other things, having to work harder to interpret non-verbal cues and focus more intently on verbal cues, all while paying attention to multiple faces – a form of multitasking that can make people feel drained and less engaged
- **Competing obligations** such as caring for siblings or other family



- **Their need for privacy**, including cases where student may be living with undocumented relatives or someone who is fleeing an abusive situation. There is also, of course, the fact that having a window into students' homes may expose/highlight inequities in living conditions that student may not want exposed, and *that* may result in students' peers or professors viewing/treating them differently as a result (note that while using a [virtual background in Zoom \(https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/210707503-Virtual-Background\)](https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/210707503-Virtual-Background) can be a workaround for this in many cases, not all students have computers that meet [the system requirements \(https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/360043484511\)](https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/360043484511) to support these virtual backgrounds)
- **Lack of financial means and other kinds of access** which may limit access to highspeed internet and/or their ability to have video and audio on at the same time. In an earlier blog on [The Connectivity Conundrum \(https://otl.du.edu/the-connectivity-conundrum/\)](https://otl.du.edu/the-connectivity-conundrum/), I talk about some ways to address this, but still there are going to be times when students are unable to connect.

APPROACHES FOR ADDRESSING THIS CHALLENGE

I do *not* take the above reasons for lack of camera use to mean that, for classes that take place entirely or partially on Zoom, we should resign ourselves to facing a screen full of black boxes. But I *do* think it means we should keep this all in mind as we decide how to proceed, and that, perhaps rather than asking, "How do we make sure that every single student has their camera on all of the time?" we ask "**How can we encourage camera use in a way that best supports learning, engagement, and well-being for *all* members of the classroom community (including ourselves)?**"

We are of course all still learning here, and this is a question we all will continue to explore. But some approaches to consider as we lean into this question include:

- **Establishing clear expectations up front** – even prior to the start of your course and certainly at the beginning of it – regarding kind of environment/culture you're hoping to create, the ways in which you expect/invite students to participate in Zoom meetings, and *why* (in syllabi, learning community guidelines, etc.)
- **Engaging students in the conversation**, as this is something they are likely grappling with too. In particular, you might invite your students into conversation around questions *such* as:

- What is the culture/community we want to create here, and how do we create it?
- And when it comes to Zoom, what guidelines/norms/practices do we want to establish?



QUESTIONS? ASK DUBOT

create to support that?

- What is the effect when we *don't* have cameras on? What is the effect when we *do*?
- What would make you more comfortable/likely to turn your camera on?
- How do we normally show each other that we're paying attention and that what others are saying matters to us? If we have cameras off, most of our usual "I'm listening" signals won't work, so what should we do instead? (this question was suggested by Anna Lännström in her blog "[Should we require students to turn their cameras on in the Zoom classroom?](https://www.wabashcenter.wabash.edu/2020/08/should-we-require-students-to-turn-their-cameras-on-in-the-zoom-classroom/)" (<https://www.wabashcenter.wabash.edu/2020/08/should-we-require-students-to-turn-their-cameras-on-in-the-zoom-classroom/>))

- **Establishing clear policies/guidance around camera use** (consistent, of course, with your own teaching philosophy/approach to attendance requirements), *such as*:

- Allowing a certain number of "camera off" days per person
- Having students let you know ahead of time if they plan/need to have their camera off (and/or telling them to message you – or put a note in the chat – if they need to unexpectedly step away)
- Treating it as an absence if a student has their camera off, you ask them if they're there and they don't respond, and they haven't communicated that they are stepping away (though I would encourage caution here, as I imagine all of us have had the experience of a momentary distraction that pulls away unexpectedly – but if this happens repeatedly it is a concern)
- Requiring that they [show a profile picture in Zoom](https://www.guidingtech.com/show-profile-picture-instead-video-zoom-meeting/) if they are not there

- **Supporting students in minimizing anxiety/stress/fatigue due to Zoom usage**, by:

- Having some camera-off/camera-optional times during class
- Encouraging students to look away from camera on occasion
- Telling students how, if looking at *themselves* on Zoom is anxiety-provoking/distracting, they can [change their Zoom settings so they can't see themselves](https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/115001077226-Hiding-or-showing-my-video-on-my-display#:~:text=Start%20or%20join%20a%20Zoom,see%20t) (<https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/115001077226-Hiding-or-showing-my-video-on-my-display#:~:text=Start%20or%20join%20a%20Zoom,see%20t> you.)



QUESTIONS? ASK DUBOT

• **Increasing the likelihood that students will want to have their cameras on in Zoom by working to build trust, connection and community.** And yes, I see the paradox here: The very thing that *lack* of camera usage can impede – this trust, connection, and community – is also the thing that might be required to get students to want to use their cameras in the first place! You might:

- Consider showing your own surroundings, at least some of the time (even if – maybe especially if – they are messy/imperfect), as demonstrating that *you* are willing to give students a window into *your* imperfect space may make them more willing to give you a window into theirs (in his blog “[How to Get Students to Turn on Their Zoom Camera](https://www.smartclassroommanagement.com/2020/10/03/students-turn-on-zoom-camera/) (<https://www.smartclassroommanagement.com/2020/10/03/students-turn-on-zoom-camera/>)”, Michael Linsin even suggests you give a tour of your messy space!)
- Encourage students to join the class meeting a few minutes early to casually chat with instructors or other students, and test that their audio and video are working (from Stanford CTL’s “[10 Strategies for Creating Inclusive and Equitable Online Learning Environments](https://sites.google.com/stanford.edu/10-strategies-for-creating-inc/home) (<https://sites.google.com/stanford.edu/10-strategies-for-creating-inc/home>)”)
- Create individual connections with students, as the better they know *you*, the more likely they may be to want to “show up” in Zoom. Some ways to do this might be having one-on-one meetings with students (even a 5 or 10 minute Zoom call can help make this connection!), or one-on-one email exchanges, or assigned times for each student to drop into virtual office hours (these examples also come from Stanford CTL’s “[10 Strategies for Creating Inclusive and Equitable Online Learning Environments](https://sites.google.com/stanford.edu/10-strategies-for-creating-inc/home) (<https://sites.google.com/stanford.edu/10-strategies-for-creating-inc/home>)”)
- Follow up with students individually if they have their camera off the whole time, e.g., “I noticed your video has been off; how can I help you be present in this online community?” (this question was a suggestion in this Edutopia article on “[Engaging Students in Virtual Instruction with the Camera Off](https://www.edutopia.org/article/engaging-students-virtual-instruction-camera) (<https://www.edutopia.org/article/engaging-students-virtual-instruction-camera>)”)
- Creating opportunities for students who have their cameras off to still engage and connect with others in the class, as if they get to know other students *that way*, and begin to feel more a part of the community, they may eventually want to “show up” on their cameras. You can do this



QUESTIONS? ASK DUBOT



MKG 420 - 800: Integrated Marketing Communications Spring 2021

Welcome to Integrated Marketing Communications! I am your professor, Dr. Kesha Coker. I designed this course to provide you with an inclusive learning experience in a highly flexible online format. We do not meet at set times for class; I will post lecture videos and other class content on Canvas. This format allows you to log in to Canvas at any time and complete activities by the due date.

In this syllabus, you will find important information about this course. This information will help you get started and will guide you throughout the semester. Please read your syllabus very carefully, and feel free to reach out to me with any questions you may have.

As we embark on this journey together, please keep our class brand mantra on your mind:

Participate, Learn, Succeed!

Let's get started!

Best regards,
Dr. Coker

My Contact Information

Here are the best ways to reach me:


Email: kkcoker@bsu.edu (expected response time within 24 hours, Monday to Friday, and 48 hours on the weekend)

Virtual Office Hours: Join me on Zoom:
Tuesday and Thursday, 3:00 pm - 5:00 pm and by appointment
<https://bsu.zoom.us/j/93655196344?pwd=TIQ3RzlSb3ZlTFJsTFc1UkZ6c0NpQT09>
Meeting ID: 936 5519 6344
Passcode: 2HDd9B

Please read the Class Communication Plan on Canvas for more information on communications in this class.

Course Schedule (Tentative)

Week	Topic	Preparation	Actions
1 (Jan. 19 - Jan. 24)	Part 1: Welcome & Introductions, Introduction to IMC	Read: Syllabus, Ch. 1 View: Video(s), Slide(s)	1. Post: Assignment 1 – Initial <i>Due Thu., Jan. 21, 11:59 pm ET</i> 2. Post: Assignment 1 – Reply 3. Complete: Quiz 1 <i>Due Sun., Jan. 24, 11:59 pm ET</i>
2 (Jan. 25 - Jan. 31)	The Role of IMC in Marketing, Organizing for IMC	Read: Ch. 2, 3 View: Video(s), Slide(s)	1. Post: Assignment 2 – Initial <i>Due Thu., Jan. 28, 11:59 pm ET</i> 2. Post: Assignment 2 – Reply 3. Submit: Group Form (Group) <i>Due Sun., Jan. 31, 11:59 pm ET</i>
3 (Feb. 1 - Feb. 7)	Consumer Behavior, The Communication Process	Read: Ch. 4, 5 View: Video(s), Slide(s), Study Guide – Exam 1	1. Submit: The Group Project Agreement (Group) 2. Submit: Brand Form (Group) 3. Complete: Quiz 2
4 (Feb. 8 - Feb. 14)	Exam 1 (Part 1: Ch. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5)	Review: Part 1	1. Attend (optional): Class Check-In on Tue. or Thu. Virtual Office Hours 2. Complete: Exam 1 <i>Due Sun., Feb. 14, 11:59 pm ET</i>
5 (Feb. 15 - Feb. 21)	Part 2: Source, Message, & Channel Factors, Objectives & Budgeting	Read: Ch. 6, 7 View: Video(s), Slide(s)	1. Post: Assignment 3 – Initial <i>Due Thu., Feb. 18, 11:59 pm ET</i> 2. Post: Assignment 3 – Reply <i>Due Sun., Feb. 21, 11:59 pm ET</i>
6 (Feb. 22 - Feb. 28)	Creative Strategy I & II	Read: Ch. 8, 9 View: Video(s), Slide(s), Study Guide – Exam 2	1. Submit: IMC Plan 1 (Group) 2. Submit: Peer Evaluation – IMC Plan 1 (Individual) 3. Complete: Quiz 3 <i>Due Sun., Feb. 28, 11:59 pm ET</i>
7 (Mar. 1 - Mar. 7)	Exam 2 (Part 2: Ch. 6, 7, 8, 9)	Review: Part 2	1. Attend (optional): Class Check-In on Tue. or Thu. Virtual Office Hours 2. Complete: Exam 2 <i>Due Sun., Mar. 7, 11:59 pm ET</i>
8 (Mar. 8 - Mar. 14)	Part 3: Media Planning & Strategy, Digital Media	Read: Ch. 10, 15 View: Video(s), Slide(s)	1. Post: Assignment 4 – Initial <i>Due Thu., Mar. 11, 11:59 pm ET</i> 2. Post: Assignment 4 – Reply <i>Due Sun., Mar. 14, 11:59 pm ET</i>
9 (Mar. 15 - Mar. 21)	TV & Radio, Magazines & Newspapers	Read: Ch. 11, 12 View: Video(s), Slide(s), Study Guide – Exam 3	1. Submit: IMC Plan 2 (Group) 2. Submit: Peer Evaluation – IMC Plan 2 (Individual) 3. Complete: Quiz 4 <i>Due Sun., Mar. 21, 11:59 pm ET</i>

Week	Topic	Preparation	Actions
10 (Mar. 22 - Mar. 28)	Exam 3 (Part 3: Ch. 10, 11, 12, 15)	Review: Part 3	1. Attend (optional): Class Check-In on Tue. or Thu. Virtual Office Hours 2. Complete: Exam 3 <i>Due Sun., Mar. 28, 11:59 pm ET</i>
11 (Mar. 29 - Apr. 4)	Part 4: Direct Marketing, Sales Promotion	Read: Ch. 14, 16 View: Video(s), Slide(s)	1. Post: Assignment 5 – Initial <i>Due Thu., Apr. 1, 11:59 pm ET</i> 2. Post: Assignment 5 – Reply <i>Due Sun., Apr. 4, 11:59 pm ET</i>
12 (Apr. 5 - Apr. 11)	PR, Publicity, & Corporate Advertising	Read: Ch. 17 View: Video(s), Slide(s)	1. Submit: IMC Plan 3 (Group) 2. Submit: Peer Evaluation – IMC Plan 3 (Individual) <i>Due Sun., Apr. 11, 11:59 pm ET</i>
13 (Apr. 12 - Apr. 18)	Support Media	Read: Ch. 13 View: Video(s), Slide(s)	1. Complete: Quiz 5 <i>Due Sun., Apr. 18, 11:59 pm ET</i>
14 (Apr. 19 - Apr. 25)	Group Work on IMC Plan Presentation	Review: Graded IMC Plan 1 - 3	<i>Nothing Due! Use this week to work on your IMC Plan Presentation.</i> 
15 (Apr. 26 - May 2)	Last Week! IMC Plan Presentation	View: Video(s), Slide(s), Study Guide – Exam 4 (Final)	1. Attend (optional): Class Check-In on Tue. or Thu. Virtual Office Hours 2. Submit: IMC Plan Presentation (Group) 3. Submit: Peer Evaluation – IMC Plan Presentation (Individual) <i>Due Sun., May 2, 11:59 pm ET</i>
Finals Week (May 3 – May 7)	Yay! Exam 4 (Final) (Part 4: Ch. 13, 14, 16, 17)	Review: Part 4	1. Complete: Exam 4 (Final) <i>Due Fri., May 7, 11:59 pm ET</i>

This syllabus is subject to revisions at any time during the semester.

ENGLISH 230: READING AND WRITING ABOUT LITERATURE

MWF 2:00-2:50pm

Room: Robert Bell 291

Professor Emily Rutter

Office: Robert Bell 390

Email: errutter@bsu.edu

Office Hours: MWF 12:1:30pm; or by appointment

“The language of food fills the pages of multi-ethnic literatures of the United States. Food tropes, metaphors, and images serve as figures of speech which depict celebrations of families and communities, portray identity crises, create usable histories to establish ancestral connections, subvert ideology and practices of assimilation, and critique global capitalism. In the United States, relationships between food and ethnicity bear historical, social, cultural, economic, political, and psychological significance.”

—Fred L. Gardaphe and Wenying Xu, “Introduction: Food in Multi-Ethnic Literatures” (2007)

“Food is often our first adventure with another culture and a way we learn to measure our own. Or do I mean poetry is?”

—Kevin Young, *The Hungry Ear: Poems of Food and Drink* (2012)

Food is a key expression of identity and culture, and thus it is no wonder that eating, cooking, and hunger play such crucial symbolic roles in literary traditions the world over. How does food function in literary texts as an expression of identity and/or a common language bridging cultural gaps? Alternatively, how do writers and directors use food (or the lack thereof) as a signifier of current and historical inequities and traumas? In this course, we will answer these questions by engaging a variety of texts, including films such as *The Hunger Games*, prose such as *The Book of Salt*, *Hunger: A Memoir of (My) Body*, *Interpreter of Maladies*, and poetic odes to favorite foods. As we engage with this interdisciplinary material, students will hone their analytical reading and discussion skills, while building their knowledge of the formal conventions of written literary analyses, including research ethics and citation guidelines. Students will also become familiar with a variety of different theoretical perspectives. By the semester’s end, students will have produced a body of work that expresses their own voices as readers, writers, and cultural critics.

This course is designed to assist students:

- Become familiar with terms and concepts necessary for the academic discussion of literary texts;
- Gain awareness of various critical methods for reading and interpreting literature and the theoretical implication of differing critical perspectives;
- Develop clear, concise academic prose through scaffolded writing assignments;
- Gain awareness of and practice conducting ethical scholarly research and incorporating that research into original arguments about literature’s relationship to popular culture.

***Note that this syllabus is subject to minor revision as I get a sense of our common interests and strengths. Moreover, students may not reproduce, record, distribute, or publicly post course materials without my permission. ***

Required texts: You MUST buy or rent these texts in order to be successful in this course.

Kevin Young, ed. *The Hungry Ear: Poems of Food and Drink* (Bloomsbury, 2012)
ISBN-13: 978-1608195510

advance. Late essays will be penalized a letter grade (10%) for every day they are late after the original deadline; those more than three days late will not be accepted unless prior arrangements have been made.

Quizzes (10%): Be prepared for unannounced reading comprehension quizzes frequently throughout the semester. You may use your reading notes (**not your laptops or your phones**) to complete these quizzes, so I highly recommend taking comprehensive notes for each reading assigned this semester. There will be no make-up quizzes.

Written Responses (10%): Your written responses (5 in total) are due by 12pm on the dates designated in the “Schedule of Assignments.” These responses must be analyses of the texts (not summaries) of at least **300-words in length**; moreover, as with all of the writing in this course, they must be composed in grammatically comprehensible English, adhere to **MLA guidelines**, and be uploaded to Canvas in a **Word** document format. Points will be deducted for failure to meet these requirements.

These written responses serve as an opportunity to test out potential arguments about the texts at hand; thus, they should *not* be focused on how you or readers in general may feel about the text. This is not a journal entry, in other words. Rather, your responses should focus on a **specific passage (1 or 2 paragraphs of prose or 2-3 lines of poetry) in the assigned literary text** (any part of the text is fine). Your response should then analyze this passage by addressing **the following questions:**

- **What** does this text suggest thematically? In other words, what message or concept is advanced in this short story, novel, poem, or film?
- **How** does the writer formally render this particular theme, message, or concept? In other words, how do image, metaphor, character, setting, allusion, diction, syntax, tone, among other literary strategies work to convey meaning?
- **Why** is this rendering significant? In this course, we will frame this question in terms of the relationship between literature and food, considering how writers and directors use food to explore issues of identity, lineage, diaspora, cultural belonging, and/or social justice.

Writing Workshops (10%): In addition to regular class discussion, you will participate in writing workshops, both as a writer and a peer reviewer. As a writer, you will be asked to share a partial draft—**your introduction, including your thesis, and one body paragraph (at least 300 words in total)**—of one of your essays with your peers. I will circulate a sign-up sheet, and you will have a choice as to when you will present your draft. You will then post your draft to the discussion board (subject line: your name and essay draft) **24 hours in advance of the day of the writing workshop**; it is imperative to meet this deadline in order to receive credit for the workshop. Your classmates and I will read your draft and respond to the following questions:

1. What are the strengths of the thesis, particularly in terms of adhering to the what-how-why thesis model? Provide an example.
2. What would make the thesis stronger? Provide an example of a part of the thesis that needs strengthening.
3. What are the strengths of the body paragraph, particularly in terms of the topic sentence-evidence-analysis-so what paragraph model? Provide an example of an especially effective sentence or component of this body paragraph.
4. What would make the body paragraph stronger? Provide an example of a part of the thesis that needs strengthening.

As a peer reviewer, you will need to answer the questions above, and post them to our Canvas site. By design, these workshops benefit all students, since everyone learns from having their draft workshopped as well as workshopping the drafts of others. Thus, your writing workshop grade is determined not only by the submission of your draft but also by the feedback you give your peers.

Essays (60%):

Essay 1 (4-5 pages)= 15%

Essay 2 (5-6 pages)= 20%

Essay 3 (6-7 pages)= 25%

Paper prompts and rubrics with specific guidelines for these essays are available on our Canvas site, and we will thoroughly review these documents in class. In short, you will complete **three** formal essays that demonstrate your ability to think critically about literature and to situate your argument within theoretical discourses pertinent to the study of contemporary literature. Please also note that in this course, we will approach *writing as a process, not a product*. Thus, throughout the semester, you will be given ample opportunities to test out your arguments in class discussion, writing workshops, and individual conferences.

Writing Center

One key to improving your writing is getting feedback and revision suggestions on your text during the writing process. The Writing Center at Ball State offers free writing feedback sessions (online or face-to-face) to all students. They work with students on essays, reports, reflections, research projects, Ib content, lesson plans, slideshows, poster presentations, resumes, and other digital or print texts. Students can make an appointment by going to www.bsu.edu/writingcenter, stopping by Robert Bell 295, or by calling 765-285-8370. Please be sure to have the consultant you work with email me a report of your session, as I take your commitment to receiving feedback into account when assessing your writing progress.

Career Center

Ball State's Career Center is eager to help you think about your future—whether you're an undergraduate or graduate student, whether you know where you're headed or have no an idea how to start. Their services include individual Career Coaching, drop-in résumé reviews, assistance researching potential careers and internships, and referrals to campus and off-campus jobs. They can tell you more about grad school, job fairs, on-campus interviews, and lots more. The English department's designated Career Coach is Eilis Wasserman, ewasserman@bsu.edu, Lucina Hall 219. You can set up an appointment with her through [Cardinal Career Link](#).

Follow #bsuenglish

The English department maintains an active online community and offers a variety of resources. Check out the department blog at <https://bsuenglish.wordpress.com/>, subscribe to our calendar, and follow us on Twitter and Facebook. You'll never miss a thing.

Statement on Plagiarism: Plagiarism, the unacknowledged dependence on some secondary source, should be avoided at all costs. You are not expected to know it all before entering my classroom; otherwise, why attend college at all? This class will provide you with an opportunity to test out and modify your interpretations; moreover, the classroom will be a safe space in which it is perfectly fine to be confused or even wrong. The purpose of a liberal arts education is to challenge yourself by confronting new concepts, ideas, and worldviews. Thus, plagiarism is not only a violation of the University's code of ethics; it also goes against the core objectives of this course and of an education in English more generally.

More specifically, the direct copying or paraphrasing of an author's written material without citation constitutes plagiarism and a violation of academic integrity. **Plagiarism includes incorporating material from CliffNotes, GradeSaver, Wikipedia, blogs, and other sites designed to quickly unpack the meaning of literary works.** Not only are these sites unreliable—often downright wrong in terms of the information they put forward—reading

Appendix - Section 3
Designing Inclusive Courses:
Inclusive learning goals and activities

Sample Assignment using UDL guideline Multiple Means of Expression

The example below is from an educational psychology course. The professor provides the students with a variety of assessment options to demonstrate the learning required of the course learning outcome.

Course Learning Outcome: Describe various types of learning and recognize the roles that learning principles play in terms of common behaviour.

Assignment

There are six choices of assignments, described below. Each one is worth 10%, and you may **choose which two assignments** to complete for your 20% assignment grade. In week 2, you will submit a brief proposal contracting for two projects, and designating your own due date for each assignment (one assignment must be submitted before midterm, the other in the second half of the course). Once accepted, these due dates are non-negotiable. More detailed assignment guidelines will be distributed once you have indicated your choices.

Assignment choices:

Not only do the assignment choices below allow for students to express their learning in a variety of ways; they also allow for the evaluation of many Essential Employability Skills.

Poster presentation:

Prepare a **scholarly**-style poster on a topic related to a type of learning we discussed in class and the role it plays in behaviour. You must include information from at least one source beyond the textbook. Present this poster to your classmates on the last day of class. This assignment may be completed with a partner.

Type of learner who may be interested in this assignment:

1. Auditory learner: prefer presentations to written papers
2. Visual learner: prefers pictures to words
3. Student with a Learning Disability: prefers presenting material orally than handing in a written assignment

Research report:

Read one current article related to a type of learning we discussed in class and the role it plays in behaviour. Write a summary of the key findings in the article and your reflections on the meaning of this research. Reference the article using APA format

Type of learner who may be interested in this assignment:

1. Visual Learner who prefers writing outlines to complete a research report
2. Student with who is hard of hearing or deaf who prefers to express their learning in writing rather than verbally

Ten minute presentation:

Prepare a ten-minute presentation, complete with visual (PowerPoint or similar) to a topic related to a type of learning we discussed in class and the role it plays in behavior **based on at least one source outside of the textbook (do not present material from the text)**. Present this during the week we are studying the related chapter.

Type of learner who may be interested in this assignment:

1. Kinaesthetic learner who prefers to "show" or "demonstrate" what was learned in an active manner.
2. Auditory learner who prefers to explain a concept than write about it
3. A student with a learning disability who prefers to work with computer software to demonstrate their learning

Video/Computer object:

Create a minimum 3-minute video or a computer learning object illustrating a concept or idea related to a type of learning we discussed in class and the role it plays in behavior. Base your content on research from the text or from another acceptable source. This assignment may be completed with a partner, and will be briefly presented to the class.

Type of learner who may be interested in this assignment:

1. Kinaesthetic learner who prefers to work on a "hands on" project and create an object.
2. A student with a physical disability who prefers to work with adaptive software on his or her computer at their own pace to create a video.

Creative Interpretation:

Interpret a topic related to a type of learning we discussed in class and the role it plays in behaviour through the creative arts (painting, poetry, song, dance etc.). Include a one page written explanation of the relationship of the interpretation to the course topic. Be prepared to briefly present this project to the class.

Type of learner who may be interested in this assignment:

1. Visual learner who prefers to express their learning by sketching or drawing a concept
2. Kinaesthetic learner who wishes to express their learning through movement such as dance or a short play.
3. Students with or without a physical or learning disability who prefers to express their learning through poetry or song.



Best Practices

Alternative Assessments



Best Practices in Alternative Assessments



A good post-secondary education facilitates numerous kinds of learning that includes acquiring factual knowledge, professional skills, and skills of application, such as critical reflection, problem solving, writing, conceptualizing, collaboration, creativity, civic and global learning, and reasoning. In order for an assessment, usually in the form of an assignment or a test, to be valid, it should measure the skills or knowledge that you have planned for your students to learn. However, many university courses still rely heavily on a narrow range of assessment tools that typically ask students to memorize large amounts of content without needing to apply it (Queen’s University Centre for Teaching and Learning, n.d.).

Besides providing important information to the instructor about the nature of student progress in terms of breadth and depth of learning (Queen’s University Centre for Teaching and Learning, n.d.), assessments can guide the way that students choose to learn. Biggs argues that what and how students learn depends on how they think they will be assessed (1999, p. 141). This means that in most cases, students will only focus on learning the skills that will permit them to do well in the class. If the only forms of assessment tools used in the class are tests or exams, the student will memorize the factual information that they need to know in order to get a good grade, forgetting much of the factual information a week later (Mazur, 2015).

In this issue of *Best Practices* we will review ways that alternative assessments, also known as authentic assessments, can be used to improve student learning.

Alternative or Authentic Assessments

The traditional form of assessment in the post-secondary course is a mid-term or final or exam. This type of assessment often fails to assess deeper forms of learning. Carefully designed assessments, on the other hand, not only evaluate what students have learned, but can motivate students in their approach to learning, helping them develop thinking and problem-solving skills, and allowing them to assess their own understanding of the course content (Ibid).

This is where alternative assessment or authentic assessment, comes in. Authentic or alternative assessments, meaning an alternative to standard tests and exams, provide a true evaluation of what the student has learned, going beyond acquired knowledge to focus on what the student has actually learned by looking at their application of this knowledge (Indiana University, n.d.). Alternative forms of assessment can allow you to see what student can and cannot do, versus what they do and do not know. They tend to evaluate applied proficiency rather than measuring knowledge (Brigham Young University, n.d.), allowing for problem solving and reflection, rather than merely providing facts as answers to specific questions (Indiana University, n.d.).

Authentic or alternative assignments typically require students to make a judgement about what information and skills they will need to solve a given problem. They ask students to answer essential questions in the discipline by using knowledge in similar ways to professionals in the field. They can often be characterized as real-world situations with accompanying real-world constraints. Alternative or authentic assignments should involve written and performative measures so that students can develop meaningful and applicable skills, and advance their knowledge of the “how” over that of the “what”

(Ibid). These types of assignments are also meant to help develop disciplinary behaviors in students, making new connections between existing skills

Traditional Assessment versus Alternative Assessment

Traditional Assessment	Alternative Assessment	What Makes it Authentic
Requires right answer	Requires high-quality performance or product, along with justifications of decisions.	Students must be able to think through why they made decisions that resulted in final product.
Questions must be unknown to students in advance	Instructions/questions/purpose must be known to students in advance.	Tasks that are to be judged should be known ahead of time. Rubrics should be provided.
Disconnected from the real world	Tied to real-world contexts and constraints. Requires student to solve realistic problem.	Task is similar in nature as to what would be encountered by a real-life practitioner.
Isolations of skills, focus on facts	A range of skills/knowledge need to be integrated in order to solve a problem.	Tasks are multi-step and multifaceted.
Easily scored	Includes complex tasks for which there may not be a right answer.	Meaningful assessment and feedback is emphasized.
“One shot” approach	Iterative in nature.	Knowledge and skills are used in more than one way.
Given a score	Opportunity to provide diagnostic feedback.	Designed to give practical experience and improve future performance.

Adapted from Indiana University’s Tip Sheet, Authentic Assessment, n.d.

Planning Alternative Assignments

Brigham Young University has created a great set of guidelines for constructing alternative assignments:

- Define a concrete and unambiguous instructional outcome/goal that you want to assess. Make sure that you include both subject-matter content and a set of skills/operations that a successful student would exhibit.
- Define what can be assessed through performance assessment, and what can be assessed through objective performance measures.
- Create tasks/assignments that elicit this behavior.
- Decide what kind of guidance you can provide while still allowing students to learn independently.
- Try the assessment out and make revisions as necessary.

Here are some additional useful questions to ask yourself, when you are deciding on what assessment to choose:

- Do you want to test acquisition of content knowledge, or the ability to apply that knowledge?
- Do you want to assess a product that a student has produced, or the process by which they produced it?
- Do you want to assess any of the following: writing ability, speaking skills, creativity, use of technology, or collaboration?
- Are specific time constraints important?
- What kind of content knowledge should students be able to demonstrate and at what level?

- What higher order thinking skills do you want students to develop and be able to demonstrate?
- Which assessment methods would allow you to understand how well students are achieving learning outcomes? Did you include more than one assessment type in your course?

Here is a list of alternative assessment strategies that you may want to consider. Please know that this is just a small subsection of the numerous strategies that are available:

Abstract	Flowchart	Podcast
Annotated Bibliography	Group Discussion	Portfolio
Autobiography/Biography	Letter to the editor	Question
Blog	Memo	Research Proposal
Brochure	Methods Plan	Review of book
Case Analysis	Multimedia presentation or	Review of literature
Cognitive Map	Essay	Statement of Assumptions
Debate	Narrative	Summary
Diagram	Oral Report	Taxonomy
Description of a Process	Outline	Thesis sentence
Diary	Personal Letter	Vlog

Adapted from the Queen's University Centre for Teaching and Learning Module on Assessment

Examples of Authentic or Alternative Assignments

Letter/Letter to the editor	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Asks student to write in first person singular perspective, which can be adapted so that they are writing from the perspective of a historical or imagined individual, or themselves. • Students are asked to develop a coherent written narrative or statement for the audience. • Requires research, disciplinary knowledge, communication skills, and creativity. • Can be adapted by numerous disciplines.
Memo	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Students prepare a one or two page memorandum or briefing about a topic that is being covered in class. Memo headings can include: background, problem, solutions with pros and cons list, final recommendation. • This exercise allows students to practice being concise and direct.
Presentations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Considered the most readily approachable method of authentic assessment. • Applies positive peer pressure, as it is likely that students will be better prepared when they have to perform before others. • Presentations are an opportunity for the development of professional skills. Student will need to prepare and rehearse, and develop an appropriate, polished use of visual aids. • Enhances professional verbal, visual, written communication skills. • Can be easily applied to many disciplines, including the sciences.
Poster presentations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The nature of the poster presentation can vary. It can consist of a summary of a work in progress, or a visual presentation that is equivalent to a term paper. • Headings to be included could be a literature review, description of topics, observations, claim/thesis, and conclusions. • Teaches professional skills for participation in academic conferences.

Portfolio of work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Students develop portfolios in order to demonstrate the evolution of their work over the course of the semester. • Students are typically asked to compile their best/most representative work and write a critical introduction and brief introduction to each piece.
Proposals	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Asking students to write a proposal for a larger, more heavily weighted project allows students to try out their ideas and set their own goals for learning before actually carrying out their projects.
Policy briefs, Reports	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policy briefs/reports ask students to address in a professional manner a research question, course of action, decision, or theory that is of interest and importance. This allows students to develop professional skills and become familiar with the specific vocabulary and style of writing in their fields.
Case studies, Simulations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Case studies present fictional scenarios that include a dilemma that requires problem solving. Students must apply higher order thinking skills in order to evaluate and apply knowledge, and to analyze the problem. • Simulations ask students to play and act out various roles within a case. This can include mock trials, mock city council or legislative meetings, and mock meetings of corporation stockholders or school boards. In simulations, students require background information that they then apply to the role.
Fishbowls	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The fishbowl is similar to a debate. A few students are selected to be in the “hot seat,” where they respond to questions, concerns, ideas, about the given topic. Other students ask questions and bring forth counter points. • This type of exercise advances student knowledge and comprehension, as well as improving skills in active listening, critical inquiry, professional communication, presentation, and group discussion.

Adapted from Queen’s University Centre for Teaching and Learning Module on Assessment, and Berkeley Centre for Teaching and Learning’s “Alternatives to Traditional Testing.”

Alternative Assessment as Formative Assessment

Assessment tools can be classified as formative or summative. Formative assessment typically monitor student learning in order to provide ongoing feedback. This approach allows instructors to improve their teaching by being able to clearly see what students are not understanding, and also allows students to improve their learning by identifying where their strengths and weaknesses lie. By monitoring progress, instructors can recognize where students are struggling, and can address them throughout. Summative assessments evaluate student learning at the end of a unit of study, typically, against a benchmark.

Alternative or authentic assessments are typically classified as formative assessments, as these assignments are typically in-process evaluations of student’s understanding, learning needs, and academic progress. Tests and exams tend to be classified as summative assessment. Summative assessments are used to assess student learning at the end of the instructional period.

In her post for the University of Waterloo’s blog, the Chalkboard, Shannon Dea writes about the benefits of authentic or formative assessments. She states that this approach gives you an opportunity, as an instructor, to see what the student is doing and how the student is doing. She states that “on this conceptualization, good assessments are designed to make salient student capacities, and student demonstration of learning outcomes, rather than to force students to cross a threshold.” Asking students to memorize knowledge that they do not apply in any meaningful way does not assist them in developing higher order

thinking skills. In Dea’s words, a true/false test does not give insight into how a student is doing. It just tells you which of your students is good at true/false tests.

The chart below, adapted from the Assessment Module created by the Queens University Centre for Teaching and Learning as part of their Teaching and Learning in Higher Education course, outlines the benefits and limitations of formative and summative assessments.

Formative	Summative
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Used throughout learning process • Provides iterative feedback • Dialogue based, may be ungraded • Identifies gaps and misunderstandings in the learning process • Demonstrates evolving understanding of a topic • More valid than conventional tests, especially for higher order thinking skills • More interesting to students and thus more motivating • Can assess more clearly what students have and haven’t learned • Process can be costly in terms of time, effort, equipment, materials, facilities, or funds. • Rating process is sometimes more subjective than traditional exams 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Used at the end of a learning process • Evaluates learning against a benchmark or standard • Provides a numeric grade that summarizes how much a student has learned • Efficient to grade • No feedback on the learning process itself • Typically high stakes, making up a significant portion of the grade • Information from summative assessments can be used formatively as well, in that both students and faculty can use it to guide their efforts moving forward

Adapted from the Queen’s University Centre for Teaching and Learning Module on Assessment, and Brigham Young University’s “Using Alternative Assessments.”

While summative evaluation is necessary and should not be disregarded, thought should be given to how it can be used to pinpoint student weaknesses and identify ways to improve course content or instruction (Carnegie Mellon University, n.d.). According to the Yale Centre for Teaching and Learning, summative assessments, which are almost always formally graded and heavily weighted, should be used in combination with formative assessments. As an instructor, you can consider a variety of ways to do this, including a combination of assignments.

Rubrics

A key to successful assessment is giving students a clear understanding of what the expectations are for their work. This is especially important for alternative assessments. Rubrics, especially those that are given alongside an assignment description, are a great way of guiding students towards success. They can also be used to provide feedback to students, strengthening the formative component of any assessment method.

What is a rubric?

Rubrics are scoring tools that describe performance expectations for students as set out by the instructor. They can be used for all assignment types. They are usually comprised of four components:

1. A description of the assignment/assessment

Work Cited

Berkeley Center for Teaching and Learning. (2018). Alternatives to Traditional Testing | Center for Teaching & Learning. Retrieved from <https://teaching.berkeley.edu/resources/improve/alternatives-traditional-testing>

Biggs, J. (1999). *Teaching for Quality Learning at University: What the Student Does*. New York: Open University Press.

Brigham Young University. (n.d). Using Alternative Assessments. Retrieved February 9, 2018, from <http://ctl.byu.edu/using-alternative-assessments>

Carnegie Mellon University (n.d.). Creating and Using Rubrics - Eberly Center - Carnegie Mellon University. Retrieved from <https://www.cmu.edu/teaching/assessment/assesslearning/rubrics.html>

Dea, S. (n.d.). How to make your assessments windows instead of doors | Arts | University of Waterloo. Retrieved February 13, 2018, from <https://uwaterloo.ca/arts/blog/post/how-make-your-assessments-windows-instead-doors>

University of Bloomington. (2018a). Alternatives to Traditional Exams and Papers. Retrieved February 9, 2018, from <https://citl.indiana.edu/teaching-resources/assessing-student-learning/alternatives-traditional-exams-papers/index.html>

Indiana University Bloomington. (2018b). Authentic Assessment. Retrieved February 9, 2018, from <https://citl.indiana.edu/teaching-resources/assessing-student-learning/authentic-assessment/index.html>

McDonald, D. (n.d.). Grading Academic Work Using Rubrics. Learning & Teaching Office, Ryerson University. Retrieved from https://www.ryerson.ca/content/dam/lt/resources/handouts/Using_Rubrics.pdf

Mazur, Eric (2014). Assessment: The Silent Killer of Learning. The Brainwaves Video Anthology. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zB-MxdOjl9w>

Nilson, L. B. (2003). *Teaching at its best: a research-based resource for college instructors* (2nd ed). Bolton, MA: Anker Pub. Co.



Queen's University. (n.d.). Assessment Strategies - Teaching and Learning in Higher Education. Retrieved from <http://www.queensu.ca/teachingandlearning/modules/assessments/index.html>

Svinicki, M. D. (2004). *Learning and motivation in the postsecondary classroom*. Bolton, Mass: Anker Pub. Co.

Walvoord, B. E. F., & Anderson, V. J. (1998). *Effective grading: a tool for learning and assessment* (1st ed). San Francisco, Calif: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Yale University Centre for Teaching and Learning. (n.d.). Creating and Using Rubrics. Retrieved from <https://ctl.yale.edu/Rubrics>



Prepared by Paulina Rousseau, Research Assistant, for the Learning & Teaching Office, 2018.

Please contact Michelle Schwartz, michelle.schwartz@ryerson.ca, with questions or suggestions for future topics.
<http://www.ryerson.ca/lt>